



**TECHNIUM**  
**SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL**

**Vol. 31, 2022**

**A new decade  
for social changes**

[www.techniumscience.com](http://www.techniumscience.com)

ISSN 2668-7798



9 772668 779000

## **The Integration of Kohlberg Moral Development Theory with Education Character**

**Mary Monalisa Nainggolan<sup>1</sup> & Lamhot Naibaho<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Magister of Christian Religious Education, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Jakarta, <sup>2</sup>English Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Jakarta

[lamhot.naibaho@uki.ac.id](mailto:lamhot.naibaho@uki.ac.id)

**Abstract.** This research aims to know the integration of Kohlberg's moral development theory with education character. It was done at Universitas Kristen Indonesia from January to June 2020. The method used in this research is a library study, in the form of research whose objects are literature works, namely scientific journals, books, articles in the mass media, and statistical data. The literature obtained was used as an alternative to answering research problems written by researchers regarding the religious and moral development of elementary-age children. The result of the study is that the implementation of character education following the conditions of the individual moral development stage is a wise effort that educators can make in the dynamics of character education. So, implementing aspects of moral knowing, moral feeling, and moral behaviour as the essence of character education will be easier if educators understand the position and stage of moral development the student is taking place.

**Keywords.** Moral development, education character, integration

### **Introduction**

Some countries have strong characteristics, such as Indonesia, Brazil and China, so that they can show the world the progress and prosperity of their nation. On the other hand, contemporary Greek states and several African and Asian countries, due to their weak character, have barely made any significant contribution to the world's progress. In Indonesia, it is undeniable that the trend of modern society today is the inability or powerlessness to distinguish between what is in the personal interest and what is in the public interest. The environment and system that tend to be hedonistic and materialistic have dragged some people to selfish and arrogant nature [1; 2]. So, the real impact around us is the pervasiveness of corruption, collusion and nepotism, sexual freedom, physical and physical oppression in mass anarchism, and various negative behaviours that, ironically, have been permissively addressed by society.

So as the accumulation of the rampant phenomena of social pathology, the character crisis is the root of the problem. Public pessimism about the phenomenon of character crisis that has penetrated the "moral disease" is a mass concern that can only be answered by the basic elements of a nation's development through the role of education [3]. Although the level of existing reality shows the failure of an education system to build basic values for the character

of a nation, it is not a delay to evaluate and reconstruct what approach is the main priority in building character as the main foundation in life of a nation's generation. Choosing the right formulation as a preventive and curative action in alleviating chronic diseases that hit the nation's children, the world of education in Indonesia tries to realise character education in various layers of formal education [4]. As a form of character education confirmation in the education world in Indonesia, since 2013, the 2013 curriculum has been implemented. The curriculum focuses more on the development of the nation's character. The Ministry of Education and Culture stated that the basis of developing the 2013 curriculum is to build character education in the nation's children, whereas the 2013 curriculum emphasises character development and skills and cognitive abilities [5].

The basic orientation of the implementation of the 2013 curriculum is to focus on the ability of children to respect the norms that become the nation's culture, including building honest, disciplined, and responsible character. Implementation of the 2013 curriculum in schools has a very useful attitude value to form a complete Indonesian human being because the curriculum contains several main human attitudes. These attitudes are spiritual, social, and skilful to shape the character of the Indonesian people as a whole. In its dynamics, character education certainly cannot ignore the condition of students as the target of education. Various psychological aspects that have the potential to have a role in giving colour to students will certainly be very influential contributors in achieving goals in the formation of their character. One of them is the aspect of the moral development of students, where understanding the moral aspect can provide support in achieving the targets of the character education process. However, not many understand that there is a very close relationship between morals and character.

Generally, the concept of character education is ready to be implemented in the field. Of course, this is not a problem as long as there are no obstacles encountered in the educational process. However, it would be nice if the prospective user knew the theoretical basis that underlies the birth of the concept to be used so that the development dynamics of the expected behaviour can be understood and implemented following the framework [6]. There are three important components in character education: moral knowing, moral feelings, and moral action/moral behaviour. These three basic components are a continuous unit in the moral development of children. Thus, studying children's moral development will also be useful as a knowledge base for carrying out character education. Based on the belief that morals greatly contribute to the process of character education, this paper will provide an overview of the stages of moral development in individuals, according to Kohlberg, so that by referring to the phasing theory of moral development, it will be able to provide support in actualising character education according to the conditions of students.

### **Research Method**

The method used in this research is a library study, in the form of research whose objects are literature works, namely scientific journals, books, articles in the mass media, and statistical data. The literature obtained was used as an alternative to answering research problems written by researchers regarding the religious and moral development of elementary-age children. After that, it is continued by reviewing information to describe the stages of children's moral and religious development and examining how the characteristics shown by children are following their developmental stages. The nature of the study conducted is descriptive analysis, namely providing education and understanding to the reader, and the type of data used in this research is secondary data.

### **Discussion**

Understanding the meaning of character education starts from understanding the definition of character itself. According to Thomas Lickona, “the character is a person's natural nature in responding to situations morally” [7]. This nature is manifested in concrete actions through good behaviour, honesty, responsibility, respect for others and other noble characters. The character is a way of thinking and behaving characteristically of each individual to live and work together, both within the family, community, nation and state [8]. Character means psychological, moral or character traits that distinguish a person from others. In another definition, it is explained that character is a stable personal attitude resulting from a progressive and dynamic consolidation process, the integration of statements and actions [9]. It can be concluded that character is the attitude and way a person responds to all stimuli and life problems around them, involving their cognitive and emotional abilities and actualised in their behaviour both within the family and society. So it cannot be denied that the character's role is very dominant in shaping the face of a nation and greatly determines the progress of a country. Understanding how big the contribution of character is in colouring the life of a nation, it cannot be denied that the role of character has a big role in every dimension of the life of a nation [10].

Phenomena that exist in all corners of the world show that a nation with a strong character can simultaneously appear as a developed and prosperous nation. The moral decay referred to by Arnold Toynbee as one of the main contributors to the destruction of a nation can be identified with the weak character of the nation concerned. So it can be concluded that the role of a nation's character greatly determines the quality of its development itself. The tough character possessed by the individual will make the individual able to survive in all stable life situations, even in the most difficult conditions. He will be able to create a conducive and meaningful life both for himself and for the environment around him. So for that, “we need an effort in order to develop positive character from an early age through character education, where character education can be defined as a deliberate effort to develop a good character based on core virtues that are objectively good for individuals and society” [11].

Socrates argues that education's most basic purpose is to shape a person into a good smart. Thousands of years after that, the main concept of the formulation of educational goals remains in the same area, namely the formation of a good human personality. Worldwide, Western education figures such as Kklikrick, Lickona, Brooks, and Goble seem to be a continuation of the mission of Socrates that morality, character or character is an unavoidable goal of the world of education. Likewise, Martin Luther King agreed with this thought by saying, “Intelligence plus character-that is the true aim of education” [12]. The descriptions of world figures who influence the world of education above illustrate that universally character education is a very substantial aspect that is agreed upon as a universal value in educational goals that applies anywhere, anytime and by anyone's thinking. The expected basic goal is to form a better human quality in attitudes, knowledge, skills, and all behaviours.

A person's character will appear in his daily habits. The tendency that arises is to always think about good things (habits of mind), want good things (habits of the heart), and do good things (habits of action). So if goodness is the substance of ideal character, then the meaning of goodness is the tendency to do good actions from a universal moral point of view, and good can be objective. Both qualities are recognised and upheld by religion and society, and on the other hand, good can also be intrinsic. Good quality is born from the conscience of a civilised human being. Starting from the objective and intrinsic criteria, it gives birth to two fundamental virtues needed to build an ideal character: respect and responsibility. “In addition to teaching these two fundamental virtues, ten essential virtues are needed to form good

character, including wisdom, justice, fortitude, self-control, love, positive attitude, hard work, integrity, gratitude, and humility” [13]. “One of the causes of a person's inability to act well even though he already knows that goodness (moral knowing) is that he is not trained to do that good (moral doing). So departing from this thought, the success of character education is largely determined by the presence or absence of knowing, loving and doing (acting) in implementing character education” [14].

This stage is the first step in character education, which in this stage aims to provide students with mastery of knowledge about values. In this aspect, six elements must be taught to students to fill the realm of knowledge (cognitive) for them, namely 1) moral awareness, 2) knowledge of moral values (moral knowing values), 3) determining the angle point of view (moral reasoning), 4) Courage to determine attitudes (decision making), 5) self-knowledge (self-knowledge) Because moral knowing is the formation of character in the cognitive component, the role of reason cannot be ignored. For this reason, Allah in His word has emphasised many times the potential of reason, where it is this reason that is the distinguishing element of humans from other God's creatures, and the reason is also a characteristic of human nature and the biggest contributor who positions humans as the noblest creatures of God.

This stage strengthens the emotional (affective) aspects of students so that they grow into individuals with character. “This reinforcement is related to attitudes that must be felt and believed by students, namely awareness of identity, which includes: 1) self-confidence (self-esteem), 2) sensitivity to the suffering of others (empathy), 3) love of truth (loving the good), 4) self-control, 5) humility” [15]. Of the five aspects involved in the dynamics of students' emotions, they will accumulate into attitudes that ultimately become the basis for the emergence of behaviour in responding to all stimuli present in students' lives.

Attitude is the courage to choose consciously [16]. After that, it is possible to follow up by defending that choice through responsible, strong and reasoned arguments. As a consequence of one's attitude, it will give birth to spiritual intelligence, which becomes spiritual strength. So in line with the opinion which explains that “intelligence which is manifested in the form of a trustworthy individual will radiate as a form of value in the form of a sense of responsibility as a manifestation of piety, addiction to interests (sense of urgency) where a person feels to be able to carry out their duties as well as possible, the trust that is manifested in the form of not only being trusted but also trusting, and respecting” [17]. Attitudes cannot be taught theoretically. Attitude transfer can be carried out effectively through the exemplary method from a teacher to students or parents to children. So it is not surprising that in the environment around us, we experience a lot of moral declines, which indicates an attitude in it due to the lack of good examples that should be a source in forming positive attitudes for the development of children's character. In addition, many parents and teachers do not understand the need for children to express their opinions as to the first step in shaping their attitudes. Children's openness to express opinions, beliefs and encouragement will anticipate the potential negative effects of an environment through the child's ability to identify, control and subdue the bad environment with the guidance of teachers and parents.

Humans are born as social beings. The success of humans as social beings can be measured by the extent to which their existence can provide benefits and even be meaningful for others. The benefits that we have to spread to others will not be realised if humans do not have the potential, abilities, and skills. It is what must be a concern for all groups, be it educators, parents and the environment so that the learning process should be directed at the formation of competencies so that students obtain outcomes that not only contribute to their

own lives but also provide benefits for the good or quality of life of others and being a burden and dependent on others [18].

According to Santrock, moral development is related to the rules and conventions about what humans should do in their interactions with other people. Moral development is behavioural changes in children's lives concerning procedures, habits, customs, or standards of values that apply in social groups. The moral development involves the development of processes in thinking, feeling, and behaving following regulations [19]. According to Havinghurst, morality comes from the existence of a value system. Values are a spiritual object of the desired state. So the condition or internal mental potential of a person to do good things following the desired values is called moral. Thus, the moral development of individuals is closely related to their social development and the strong influence of cognitive, affective, and conative development [20]. For children, moral development is initially developed through the fulfilment of biological needs, but then it is patterned through experiences gained in the family environment, which are, of course, following the values that apply therein. Therefore, moral development is strongly influenced by the parent's role as the closest person to the child (especially the mother) as a contributor to the pattern of moral development for the next child.

In Kohlberg's Theory of Moral Development, Kohlberg's theory of moral development is the lubricant, modification, and refinement of Piaget's theory of cognitive development. Attention to how children think about matters relating to moral values was pioneered by Piaget in 1932 through his extensive and in-depth research using observation and interview methods on children aged 4- 12 years old [21]. Piaget raised moral issues in his research, such as stealing, lying, punishment, and justice. From the results of his research, Piaget divided the stages of moral development based on the way of reasoning, namely: a) 4-7 years: heteronomous morality stage; at this stage, the child's way of thinking about justice and regulations is objective and absolute [22], meaning that it cannot be changed and cannot be eliminated by human power; b) 7-10 years: transitional stage; the child exhibits some traits from the heteronomous morality stage, and some other traits from the autonomous morality stage; and c) 10- and so on: the stage of autonomous morality; Children show awareness that humans created rules and laws, therefore in evaluating an action, children not only consider the consequences of an action but also consider the intentions and efforts of the perpetrator.

Essentially Piaget's findings on moral judgment in cognitive development “agree with the two-stage theory. Children younger than 10 or 11 years of age think about moral dilemmas in one way, whereas older children think in various ways. Younger children view rules as absolute and standard” [23]. For them, rules are a product of their parents or God that must be obeyed, and no one can change them. However, older children understand that the rules may change as long as all parties agree upon them. Rules are not sacred or absolute but are tools humans use cooperatively. Around the age of 10-11 years, children's moral thinking begins to experience a shift. “Younger children perceive that moral judgments depend on consequences, whereas older children view them as manifestations of intentions or intentions” [24].

So Piaget gave the example of a small child who broke 15 cups while helping his mother and another child who broke one cup while trying to steal a chocolate cake. The younger child would think that the first child did worse than the first child. It is because younger children will be more focused on the number of cups broken (consequences, impact), while older children will rate greater errors in the second child because the group is more focused on the motive or intention of the act. The theory of moral development pioneered by Piaget was later developed by Kohlberg, who divided the stages of moral development from childhood to adulthood. Moral development continues to develop until the age of 16 years. Therefore, people

assume that moral problems will continue to develop during adolescence. So Kohlberg continued to conduct interviews with groups of teenagers so that the results of his research perfected the stages given by Piaget. 4. Stages of Moral Development According to Kohlberg in his research, Lawrence Kohlberg managed to show six stages in developing the moral judgment of children and young people. The six ideal types are obtained by changing the three Piaget/Dewey stages and making them three "levels", each of which is further divided into two "stages". The three "levels" are pre-conventional, conventional and post-conventional.

“Children in the pre-conventional stage often behave good and are responsive to cultural labels about good and bad, but he interprets all these labels in terms of their physical (punishment, reward, kindness) or in terms of the physical strength of those who enforce the rules and call the label about good and bad” [25]. This level is usually present in children aged four to ten years. There will be two stages at this level: Stage I, punishment and obedience orientation: Punishment orientation and unquestioned respect for a higher power. “The physical consequences of actions, regardless of their human meaning or value, determine these actions' good and bad qualities. Followed by stage 2: Instrumental-relativist orientation: Right action is one that instrumentally satisfies the individual's own needs and sometimes the needs of others. Human relations are seen as relationships in public places” [26]. There are elements of fairness, reciprocity, and equality of distribution, but all are always interpreted physically, pragmatically, reciprocally, and not about loyalty, gratitude or justice. The two stages in this initial stage are called instrumental hedonism, where reciprocity plays a role here but is still "moral revenge". These two stages are also following the time of the pre-operational stage in Piaget's theory of cognitive development. The second level, or the conventional level, which occurs between “the ages of 10-and 13, can also be described as the conformist level, although that term may be too narrow. At this level, the child only follows the family expectations, group or nation and is seen as something of value in himself, regardless of the immediate and tangible consequences” [27].

Individuals seek to conform to their social order and maintain, support, and justify that social order. “At the conventional level, there are two stages: stage 3, namely the orientation of personal agreements or the orientation of sweet children. At this stage, good behaviour is behaviour that pleases or helps others, and they approve of that. There is a great deal of conformity with stereotypical images of what is considered the majority's behaviour or 'natural' behaviour. Behaviour is often judged according to intention” [28]. The phrase "he means well" becomes important and is overused for the first time. People seek approval by behaving "good". Then it is followed by stage 4, where the child will set the orientation of law and order and orientation to authority, fixed rules and maintenance of social order. Right action is carrying out one's duties, showing respect for authority, and maintaining certain social orders. People earn respect by behaving according to their obligations. The post-conventional level that occurs at the age of 13 years and over is characterised by a major drive towards autonomous, independent moral principles, which have validity and application, regardless of the groups or individuals' authority who hold them and regardless the groups or individuals authority who hold them and identification of the individual with these individuals or groups. At this level, there is a clear attempt to formulate moral values and principles that have validity and can be applied regardless of the group's authority or the person holding those principles. “At the post-conventional level, we see two stages, namely stage 5; Legalistic social contract orientation and a social contract orientation, generally with a legalistic and utilitarian basis. Right action tends to be defined as shared rights and measures that have been critically examined and agreed upon by the whole society” [29].

There is a clear relativism of personal values awareness and opinions and an emphasis on appropriate procedures for reaching an agreement regardless of what is constitutionally and democratically agreed upon. Right and wrong is a matter of personal values and opinions. The result emphasises the legal point of view but highlights the possibility of changing the law based on rational considerations of social utility rather than freezing it in the framework of law and order as in the stage 4 style. Outside the legal sphere, free agreements and contracts are binding liability elements. This level is ended by stage 6, which contains the Universal Ethical Principle Orientation. Orientation on conscientious decisions and self-chosen ethical principles refer to logical understanding, thoroughness, universality, and consistency. These principles are abstract and ethical (golden rule, categorical imperative).

Providing character education should be gradual following the phase of child development. Educating character, is educating three aspects of human personality, namely moral knowing, moral feeling or attitudes, and moral behaviour. Good character consists of knowing what is right, intending to do what is right, and practising good thinking habits, heart and acting. All three are needed to lead a moral life and improve moral maturity. Good character education must involve not only the aspect of 'knowing the good' (moral knowing) but also 'desiring the good' or 'loving the good' (moral feeling) and 'acting the good' (moral action). "Emphasis on these aspects is needed so that students can understand, feel, and work at the same time on the values of virtue without having to be indoctrinated or ordered by force. In moral knowing, there are six things that he teaches, namely: 1) moral awareness, 2) knowing moral values, 3) perspective taking, 4) moral reasoning, 5) decision making, and 6) self-knowledge. In moral feeling, six things are aspects of emotion that a person must feel to become a human character, namely: 1) conscience, 2) self-esteem, 3) empathy, 4) loving the good, 5) self-control, and 6) humanity" [30].

Meanwhile, in moral action, which is the result of two other character components, three aspects of the character are needed, namely: 1) competence, 2) desire (will), and 3) habit. Instilling the substance of character with a moral footing will not be done if educators do not understand children at what age and how the character of moral development at that age. The role of educators in pursuing character education can be based on a thorough understanding of the condition of students regarding the developmental tasks that have been achieved by students, especially in the aspect of moral development. Educators should understand what has been achieved and what must be achieved in the task of moral development of students.

So the educator's understanding of the concept of moral development can be a reference for educators in implementing proportional character education according to the conditions of students. The above statement in its implementation can be described as follows; For example, when an educator must accompany students between the ages of 4 to 10 years, the educator must understand that students are in a pre-conventional stage of moral development. In this stage, the student often behaves "good" and is responsive to cultural labels about good and bad, but he interprets all these labels from a physical point of view (punishment, reward for kindness). "Educators must also understand that their moral existence at that age is more punishment and obedience oriented, followed by a relativist-instrumental orientation where right action is an act that instrumentally satisfies the individual's own needs. Sometimes the needs of others are physical and pragmatic, where physical consequences of actions, regardless of their human meaning or value, determine the good and bad qualities of these actions" [31]. So the emphasis that educators can give on the three aspects of character education is to adapt more to the two orientations of obedience. Building moral knowing, moral feelings/attitudes, and moral behaviour at that age will be easier if students understand a causal



relationship or a reciprocal relationship in behaviour. For example, students are easier to obey when they have to be ordered to calm down in their surroundings. In class, and consequently, they will not be allowed to go home if they are noisy. However, when the teacher forbids noisy students because it will disturb the concentration of their friends, of course, this will be more difficult for them to obey because it does not directly impact them. The above treatment is certainly not suitable when educators are faced with groups of children aged over 13 years, which is at the post-conventional level, according to Kohlberg.

Children at this age are more oriented toward legalistic social contracts, so that right actions tend to be defined in terms of shared rights and measures that have been critically tested and agreed upon by the whole community. So in, emphasising each rule in this age group should instil awareness about values and personal opinions about a behaviour. For example, why are they prohibited from being noisy in class? The teacher no longer threatens punishment in the form of a ban on going home for those who are noisy, as in the example above what happened to children at the pre-conventional level, but the teacher builds more understanding on them that it is important to create a calm atmosphere in the classroom. In order to build situations and conditions that support their concentration in the learning process in the classroom, teachers have to make an effort. So the teacher's effort is to build shared awareness about the responsibility to create a conducive atmosphere in the classroom more effectively than understanding through punishment. This example illustrates that understanding the stages of moral development will greatly assist educators in providing appropriate treatment for the development of the moral aspects of students, especially in developing their personalities through effective character education.

### **Conclusion**

The urgency of character education for each individual is an absolute thing to do as an effort to build a generation that is contributive to the progress of the nation. Character education efforts certainly cannot be separated from the psychological aspects contained in the individual, which may be influential in achieving the success of character building itself. One of the psychological aspects of the individual that has the most significant influence on the development of an individual's personality is the moral aspect. Thus, Lawrence Kohlberg offers the stages of moral development in individuals, which with our understanding of the stages involved in moral development, will help the educators actualise effective character education with the support of this moral development theory. Implementing character education following the individual moral development stage conditions is a wise effort that educators can make in the dynamics of character education. Implementing aspects of moral knowing, moral feeling, and moral behaviour as the essence of character education will be easier if educators understand in which position and stage of moral development the student is taking place.

### **References**

- [1] Shwetha TS, Kaur A. Finding the Long-Lost Path: Developing Environmental Awareness Through the Pandemic. In *The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on Green Societies 2021* (pp. 93-112). Springer, Cham.
- [2] Rolston H. *Environmental ethics*. Temple University Press; 2012 Jun 20.
- [3] White B. Scapegoat: John Dewey and the character education crisis. *Journal of moral education*. 2015 Apr 3;44(2):127-44.

- [4] Naibaho L. The Role of Education and Culture in the Development of Character and Civilization of the Indonesian Nation's Complexity. *Jurnal the Ary Suta Center Series on Strategic Management*. 2014;27(0):69.
- [5] Tyas EH, Sunarto S, Naibaho L. Building superior human resources through character education. *TEST Engineering & Management*. 2020;83:11864-73.
- [6] Fisher G. Effectuation, causation, and bricolage: A behavioral comparison of emerging theories in entrepreneurship research. *Entrepreneurship theory and practice*. 2012 Sep;36(5):1019-51.
- [7] Lickona T. *Educating for character: How our schools can teach respect and responsibility*. Bantam; 2009 Sep 2.
- [8] Banks JA. The nature of multicultural education. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*,. 2013:3-24.
- [9] Jinping X. Secure a decisive victory in building a moderately prosperous society in all respects and strive for the great success of socialism with Chinese characteristics for a new era. Indelivered at the 19th National Congress of the Communist Party of China 2017 Oct 18 (Vol. 18)..
- [10] Hauff S, Richter NF, Tressin T. Situational job characteristics and job satisfaction: The moderating role of national culture. *International business review*. 2015 Aug 1;24(4):710-23.
- [11] Suarta I. Revitalization of oral literature tradition of Balinese society based character values as deradicalism effort. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*. 2017 Dec 1;1(3):8-16.
- [12] Oppenheimer MF, Fialkov C, Ecker B, Portnoy S. TEACHING TO STRENGTHS Character Education for Urban Middle School Students. *Journal of Character Education*. 2014 Jul 1;10(2):91.
- [13] Lickona T. *Character matters: How to help our children develop good judgment, integrity, and other essential virtues*. Simon and Schuster; 2004 Feb 10.
- [14] Berkowitz MW, Bier MC. *What works in character education: A research-driven guide for educators*. Washington, DC: Character Education Partnership. 2005 Feb.
- [15] Shaikh S, Siddiqui DA. How Moral Character Strengths Pay in Work: The Complementary Role of Self-Control and Self-Confidence in Influencing Ethical Leadership, That Consequently Affect Leader Outcomes. Available at SSRN 3756987. 2020 Dec 29.
- [16] Sosik JJ, Chun JU, Ete Z, Arenas FJ, Scherer JA. Self-control puts character into action: Examining how leader character strengths and ethical leadership relate to leader outcomes. *Journal of Business Ethics*. 2019 Dec;160(3):765-81.
- [17] Korteling J, van de Boer-Visschedijk G, Blankendaal R, Boonekamp R, Eikelboom A. Human-versus artificial intelligence. *Frontiers in artificial intelligence*. 2021 Jan 1;4.
- [18] Dyganova EA, Yavgildina ZM. Development of student musician's methodological competence in practice-oriented university environment. *Utopía y praxis latinoamericana: revista internacional de filosofía iberoamericana y teoría social*. 2020(5):113-25.
- [19] Tomasello M. The normative turn in early moral development. *Human Development*. 2018;61(4-5):248-63.
- [20] Kohlberg L, Puka BE. *Kohlberg's original study of moral development*. Garland Publishing; 1994.
- [21] Kohlberg L. *Moral Development: Kohlberg's original study of moral development*. Taylor & Francis; 1994.

- [22] Moheghi M, Ghorbanzadeh M, Abedi J. The investigation and criticism moral development ideas of Kohlberg, Piaget and Gilligan. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*. 2020 Mar 24;7(2):362-74.
- [23] Malti T, Ongley SF. The development of moral emotions and moral reasoning. *Handbook of moral development*. 2014;2:163-83.
- [24] Ruckert JH. Justice for all? Children's moral reasoning about the welfare and rights of endangered species. *Anthrozoös*. 2016 May 3;29(2):205-17.
- [25] Tadjuddina N, Elfiah R, Meriyatic M, Suardi I, Wekked AS. The interaction of children's early moral development process through a holistic approach. *Interaction*. 2019;8(9).
- [26] Forsha SK. Virtue and moral development, changing ethics instruction in business school education. *College Student Journal*. 2017 Sep 1;51(3):429-43.
- [27] Baker ER, Liu Q. Moral reasoning and moral behavior: Intersections of reasoning with aggressive forms and functions in early childhood. *Early Education and Development*. 2021 May 19;32(4):534-52.
- [28] Hassan LM, Shiu E, Shaw D. Who says there is an intention-behaviour gap? Assessing the empirical evidence of an intention-behaviour gap in ethical consumption. *Journal of Business Ethics*. 2016 Jun;136(2):219-36.
- [29] Gostin LO, Friedman EA, Ooms G, Gebauer T, Gupta N, Sridhar D, Chenguang W, Røttingen JA, Sanders D. The joint action and learning initiative: towards a global agreement on national and global responsibilities for health. *PLoS Medicine*. 2011 May 10;8(5):e1001031.
- [30] Baharun H, Ummah R. Strengthening Students' Character in " Akhlaq " Subject through Problem Based Learning Model. *Online Submission*. 2018;3(1):21-30.
- [31] Mair J, Noboa E. Social entrepreneurship: How intentions to create a social venture are formed. In *Social entrepreneurship 2006* (pp. 121-135). Palgrave Macmillan, London.