

## CLINICAL SUPERVISION GUIDELINE PATTERNED ON REFLECTIVE PEDAGOGICAL PARADIGM TO ENHANCE TEACHER'S COMPETENCY IN STRADA JAKARTA

**Aurelia Maria Djanu Rombang<sup>1</sup> and Hotmaulina Sihotang<sup>2</sup>**

Educational Management Department of Post Graduate Programs, Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Jalan Mayjen Sutoyo No. 2 Cawang, Jakarta, 13510, Indonesia,  
Email: hotmaulina.sihotang@uki.ac.id

**Abstract:** Clinical supervision guideline patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm to enhance teacher's competency in Strada Jakarta. This study aims to identify things that are still lacking in supervision guidance products used in Strada schools. The results of the study indicate that there are some shortcomings that must be updated from the manual which so far has been used. There's a product produced in the form of a book titled Guidelines for clinical supervision that is patterned on the reflective pedagogical paradigm which is a theory of clinical supervision and learning patterns of reflective pedagogical paradigm, a technical guideline for supervision.

**Keywords:** Clinical supervision. Reflective pedagogical paradigm, Teachers' competency.

**Abstrak:** Panduan pengawasan klinis yang terpadu pada paradigma pedagogi reflektif untuk meningkatkan kompetensi guru di Strada Jakarta. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi hal-hal yang masih kurang dalam produk bimbingan pengawasan yang digunakan di sekolah Strada. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa ada beberapa kekurangan yang harus diperbarui dari buku pedoman yang sejauh ini telah digunakan. Ada produk yang dihasilkan dalam bentuk buku berjudul Pedoman untuk pengawasan klinis yang berpola pada paradigma pedagogis reflektif yang merupakan teori pengawasan klinis dan pola pembelajaran paradigma pedagogis reflektif, pedoman teknis untuk pengawasan.

**Kata kunci:** Supervisi klinik, Paradigma pedagogik Reflektif, Kompetensi guru

### INTRODUCTION

Facing the reality that the world is experiencing the intense and competitive competition in almost all aspects including employment aspects, the government continues to seek improvements in all aspects including education aspects. The education sector is one of the aspects considered as a determining factor in the quality of education, therefore the efforts to improve the quality of education are the focus of government's attention.

Improving the quality of education is a complex work because the improvement in the quality of education includes many things, including the education system itself and the people who run the education system, which in this context are the teachers. According to Danim (2010) the most instrumental

element in producing an education outcome is the teachers. Improving the quality of education must be started by improving the teachers' quality.

Teachers are subsystems of an education system that has a central role in producing high-quality graduates who are competitive in the era of globalization. To produce high-quality graduates, quality learning is needed, Sultoni Ahmad, et al (2014) added the statement that quality learning will only be produced by a professional teacher. Being a professional teacher means excelling in the four competencies that must be possessed by a teacher. Those competencies are pedagogical competence, professional competence, personality competence and social competence.

Teachers who are excellent in those four competencies will influence the implementation of teaching and learning activities in the classroom. The success of a teaching and learning activity will be seen in student learning outcomes. Therefore, what is important now is the teacher's competence in organizing learning in the classroom, because everything starts from the teaching and learning process in the classroom. Hotmaulina et al (2019) also emphasize that teachers have a strategic role in preparing students' competency in learning so that the teachers need to continue to improve teaching performance in the classroom and need to get direction and guidance from those who are capable to provide the guidance for teachers. The guidance can be obtained through supervision activities.

Supervision is functioned to ensure that educational standards are achieved and supervision gives a very important and big impact on the development of school. So we can see how crucial supervision is. It is really needed to be done for teachers to improve their teaching competencies in order to make a lot of impact on the development of education.

The facts that happened was that supervision was inadequate and was not optimally fulfilled in *Strada* School in North and East Jakarta. Hence, the teachers did not know their weaknesses and shortcomings in teaching and did not get any feedback in organizing teaching and learning activities.

Starting from the reality that happened and the experience that was experienced by the researcher in the workplace, the researcher wanted to find out the implementation of supervision that had already carried out in *Strada* school in North and East Jakarta. The researcher also wanted to find the things that had been good and the things that had not been inadequate in the existing supervision model at *Strada* school in North and East Jakarta. Through this research the researcher produces a continuous clinical supervision module

that can answer the actual needs of teachers in accordance with the current conditions of *Strada* schools and adheres to the distinctive characteristics echoed in *Strada* schools, which is reflective pedagogical paradigm.

The problems that arise in this study are first, what are the good things and things that need to be improved in the supervision model that is used in *Strada* school in North and East Jakarta Branch? The second, how is the design of clinical supervision guidelines patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm to improve teachers' competency in *Strada* school in North and East Jakarta Branch? (3) how is the feasibility of a clinical supervision guideline design patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm to improve teacher competency of *Strada* school teachers in North and East Jakarta Branch?

So, the purposes of this study are the first to find out things that are good and things that are lacking in the supervision system implemented at *Strada* school in North and East Jakarta. Secondly, to produce a supervision manual that can be used as one of reference in carrying out clinical supervision patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm. The third, to determine the feasibility of the supervision manual that has been designed.

Along with the development of technology and human civilization, education must also adapt to existing advances, the efforts must be made to renew the education. Teachers who have a central role in the world of education become one of the agents of educational renewal, but before renewing education system, teachers must update their quality first. Mukhtar and Iskandar (2013) asserted that the basic effort in improving aspects of education starts from school renewal. School renewal can be an initial way to achieve educational renewal. From 9 aspects in school renewal, human resources are one of the important aspects that can

help in answering the challenges faced by education sphere.

Mukhtar and Iskandar (2013) said that education supervision is an effort to coordinate and guide the ongoing growth of teachers in schools both individually and in groups. The aims and benefits of implementing educational supervision are first, educational supervision arousing the excitement of teachers in carrying out their duties. The second is that educational supervision builds a harmonious collaboration among all components in the school, and the third with the existence of educational supervision, teachers jointly seek to know and develop the learning methods.

There are 3 functions of supervision activities. First, through supervision, the quality of a school will be detected clearly. Secondly, supervision functions as a trigger for changes in elements related to education and third, supervision is a leading and guiding activity. Sahertian and Mataheru (1981) explained 10 detailed things about supervision; (1) supervision helps teachers to clearly see educational goals, (2) supervision helps the teachers to guide the students, (3) supervision helps the teachers to use the learning resources, (4) supervision assists the teachers in using modern learning methods and tools, (5) supervision assists the teachers in meeting the students' learning needs, (6) supervision assists the teachers in assessing the students' progress and results, (7) supervision helps the teachers in fostering the mental and moral reaction of the teacher's work, (8) supervision helps the new teachers in school so that they feel happy in doing their work, (9) supervision helps the teacher to make the adjustments to the community easier, (10) supervision helps the teachers to make their time and energy to be fully devoted to school coaching.

Clinical supervision is one of the 4 approaches used in implementing teaching supervision. Supervision with this clinical approach was first raised by

Cogan (1973). Some experts express their opinions on clinical supervision, Keith Achesson and Meredith D.Gall in Mukhtar and Iskandar (2013) said that clinical supervision is the process of helping teachers reduce the gap between real teaching behavior and ideal teaching behavior. It can be concluded that clinical supervision is a form of supervision which leads to structured guidance by competent parties beginning with observing and finding the symptoms and causes that cause mismatches in the teaching process of a teacher, then analyzing the symptoms and causes and offering the solutions and guidance so that changes in teaching behavior occur.

La Sulo in Purwanto (2014) stated the characteristics of clinical supervision. The following are some of the characteristics of clinical supervision seen from its implementation, including: 1) supervisor guidance to teachers is a help not a command. 2) the types of skills to be supervised are reviewed jointly between teachers and supervisors, 3) supervision instruments are developed and agreed with supervisors and teachers, 4) feedback is given directly and is objective in nature, 5) supervisors ask more questions and listen, 6) supervision takes place in a cycle that includes planning, observation, discussion and feedback meetings, 7) supervision is used to shape and improve teaching skills.

There are 3 stages in the implementation of clinical supervision. Those three stages are preliminary meetings, teaching observations, and feedback meetings. The preliminary meeting stage is the initial stage where supervisors and teachers discuss matters that will be of concern in the observation phase. The supervisor together with the teacher discusses the plan of teaching skills to be observed.

Observation Stage (Class Observation) is the main stages in the clinical supervision cycle. For teachers who experience supervision, this stage is useful for practicing teaching skills.

Feedback Meeting Stage is the evaluation stages of the teacher's behavior in teaching which are observed at the observation stage. At this stage, the supervisor analyzes the findings related to the teaching behavior of the teacher, finding solutions to obstacles in teaching performance.

The Government Regulation No. 19 of 2005 concerning National Education Standards, article 28 paragraph (3) explains the details of the four teacher competencies. The four teacher competencies are pedagogical competence, personal competence, social competence and professional competence.

Teachers' pedagogical competence, including understanding insight about education, understanding of students, curriculum or syllabus development, learning design, implementing learning that is educative and dialogical, evaluating learning outcomes, developing students to actualize various potentials that they have.

Teachers' personality competencies, including steady, stable, mature, wise and authoritative, noble character, role models, evaluating performance, and developing themselves in a sustainable manner owned by a teacher.

Teachers' social competence, including the ability to communicate orally as well in writing, using communication and information technology functionally, the ability to socialize politely with the surrounding community.

Teachers' professional competence, including the ability of a teacher to master concepts, structures and scientific methods, technology, art that is coherent with the teaching materials, the ability to master teaching material available in school curricula, mastery of concept relationships between subjects, the ability to apply scientific concepts in daily life and the ability to compete professionally in a global context while preserving national values and culture.

The quality of education is reflected in the quality of teacher. Talking about

quality in this context, we refer to the output produced by a teacher, in this case, it is the students. Qualified students are produced by from high-quality teaching and learning in the classroom so that Selvi (2010) stated that it's important to improve their skill in order to enhance their teaching performances, she also added seeing the importance of teacher's teaching performances, there are many studies that focus on the effort on enhancing teacher's teaching skill rather than another teachers' competency.

Being an inovative teacher is really needed especially in developing the inovation in teaching. Chang Zu et al (2013) concluded that an innovative teacher will be able to understand the students' individual differences, fasilitate the active learning for students, develop the students creative potential, stimulate students' learning interests, improve the effectiveness of learning as well improving the learning proses. Hence, having a teaching inovation is an important skill that is needed to be possessed by a teacher in order to mold a high-quality output.

Teachers' teaching competency can be developed through clinical supervision. This is in line with an opinion with Cut et al (2019) that stated that supervision works to assist teacher in preparing lesson by coordinating theory with practice. Mukhtar (2014) also illustrates the importance of developing the teachers' competency in supervision to enrich the knowledge of teachers both in science and in the way they organize the learning process. Cut et al (2019) also added that supervision must be routinely carried out for teacher as one of the positive activity in improving the learning process.

Carrying out the supervision for teacher is the responsibility of a school principal. Simin et al (2019) said that supervisions in school are run by either leader of school which is principal, or individuals which are appointed by Ministry of education. The same thing was revealed by a law that stated that the

principal has an obligation to assist teacher in improving the quality of learning. Sahertian dan Sahertian (1990) mention the role of principals in improving the teachers' teaching competency. Including assisting teachers in understanding teaching and learning strategies, assisting teacher in formulating teaching goals, assisting teachers in formulating the learning experiences, assisting teachers in formulating the learning activities.

The focus of supervision in this research is teaching on giving feedback on how the teachers conduct the reflective pedagogical learning. The reflective pedagogical paradigm is defined as a learning pattern that implements reflection as a way to find the values obtained in learning, to be used as a guide in life, have a concern, so that in the future there will be born perpetrators of strong social change, who are able to strive for a life together that is characterized by true brotherhood, justice, solidarity, and partiality for the weak.

Setyowati and Louise (2018) stated that reflective pedagogical paradigm lesson emphasizes on reflective process. Through reflective process the students have the opportunity to look deeper into the meaning of learning. The impacts that is given through reflective pedagogical paradigm are improving the students' motivation to learn, intensifying the full understanding of attitude and humanitarian values that is gained in the learning process.

The editorial team of Kanisius (2008) formulated an explanation of learning of the Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm pattern that learning with the Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm Pattern integrates the learning process with values. Learning is adapted to the context of students, while values in learning are developed and explored through the dynamics of experience, reflection and action

In the context element the teacher develops subject matter that is relevant to the current life situation with teaching

methods that are adapted to the conditions and situations of the students. The adapted learning context can be in the daily life of students, social, economic, political conditions which are the scope of students' lives, the atmosphere and conditions of the school, the beliefs and values that are flourishing in the present lives of the students.

Learning with a Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm pattern is learning that provides a full learning cycle for students. In learning the Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm pattern, students are invited to feel, interpret deeply the learning process that has been experienced

The teacher facilitates students with reflective questions, so that students review their experiences in learning and find their own meaning in more depth from the learning experience experienced.

The teacher facilitates students to grow their intentions and formulate concrete steps forward based on the beliefs obtained in reflection. The teacher evaluates cognitive, affective and psychomotor aspects of the learning that has been conducted. Evaluation aims to find out the progress achieved by students, what are the signs of students' progress, are there any obstacles in the learning process, and how to overcome those obstacles

## **METHOD**

This research is a type of research and development that aims to produce a product that can be used in education and its validity is known so that its use can be tested. the product developed by researchers in this study is a guidebook to carry out clinical supervision with a reflective pedagogical paradigm pattern. The study began in August 2019, this research lasted approximately 6 months and was carried out in several places. The validation data collection was carried out at *Strada* branch Office in North Jakarta and for product trials, it is tested by two principals, the first *Strada*

Santa Anna Junior High principal and *Strada* Santo Fransiskus Xaverius III Junior High principal.

The development procedure used in developing the product in this study adopted the &D model developed by Sugiyono (2017). The development procedure used is an R&D model at level 3. Research and development steps at level 3 include (1) existing product research, (2) literature studies, (3) field research, (4) product design, (5) internal design tests, (6) design revisions, (7) product manufacture, (8) product trials, (9) product revisions, (10) product dissemination and implementation, but researchers, simplify this research into 8 stages. The eight stages used by researchers in developing products are existing product research, literature studies, product design, design validation, design revisions, limited trials, product revisions, final product improvements.

The data collected in this study is grouped into 2 types, they are data on the product development process, and product eligibility data. Data in the product development process are qualitative data in the form of existing product research analysis notes, suggestions provided by product validators and product testers, while product feasibility data are quantitative data. Quantitative data obtained in the form of assessment scores.

To determine the quality and feasibility of the product, a product design validation is performed. Product validation is carried out by 2 experts who are experienced in the field of supervision, they are the government supervisors and supervisors of *Strada* schools. The Experts provide assessment and input on general material aspects, specific material aspect, language feature, presentation aspect, completeness of presentation aspect, overall appearance aspect, and product usage aspect After getting a lot of input from the experts, the researchers then revised the product based on the things that the experts noted.

The product was then trialled to two school principals. The head of the school tested the product by using a standard product guide in carrying out supervision to his teachers. Then give an assessment of aspects of the material, linguistic, appearance, and ease of use

To find out the feasibility of the product, researchers conducted calculations to find out, the average score assessment, product validity and product eligibility. Stages of data analysis techniques begins with calculating the average score of data collected using formulas  $\bar{X} = \frac{\sum X}{N}$ ,

Change the average score into a qualitative score with the total rating criteria by using the following formula, shown by table 1.

**Table 1. Range of scores**

Formula	Category
$X > \bar{X}_1 + 1,80 \times S_{b_i}$	Excellent
$X \leq \bar{X}_1 + 0,60 \times S_{b_i}$	Good
$X \leq \bar{X}_1 - 0,60 \times S_{b_i}$	Fair
$X \leq \bar{X}_1 - 1,80 \times S_{b_i}$	poor
$X \leq \bar{X}_1 - 1,80 \times S_{b_i}$	Very poor

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The output of this research is a guidebook, not only producing products, this study also aims to determine the feasibility of the products that have been developed. Products that are developed are declared eligible for use if they are validated by material experts and tested by parties related to the product.

There are 8 stages of research conducted in this study, and the results of the study are as follows

**a) Research existing products**

At the stage of existing product research it was found that the guidebook used as a guide for implementing supervision in Strada Schools has advantages and disadvantages, such as having clear instructions for use with a standard language that is easy to understand making it easier for users to use it, things that becomes a lack of products is that the product is not equipped by the complete guidance on supervision planning until the evaluation of the implementation of supervision, this book only contained instructions for supervision. This manual is also not equipped with clear assessment indicators. For Strada schools, in Format B (Learning Observation Checklist) the existing supervision instruments do not contain an assessment of learning with a Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm pattern and at the end of the manual the bibliography is not written as a reference in developing a guidebook. Based on these deficiencies researchers developed guidelines that cover these deficiencies.

**b) Literature study,**

The material used in the guidebook consists of general supervision material, the concept of clinical supervision, learning of reflective pedagogical patterns of paradigm. In addition to collecting material that will be referred to in the guidebook, at this stage the researcher also develops a validation instrument grid for the product to be developed.

**c) Product design**

The product design phase begins with determining the title of the manual, determining the parts of the manual, applying the supervision materials in the manual, designing the rubric of the supervision appraisal indicator, designing the supervision instrument and the supervisory evaluation pattern

**d) Application of theories in guidebooks**

There are 3 types of theories applied in the guidebook. Those materials are material about supervision, clinical supervision, and learning pedagogical paradigm patterns. Those materials were applied into the guidebook in the form of technical guidelines for supervision, teaching assessment indicators and teaching performance, planning program tables, supervision scheduling and evaluation, teaching instrument evaluation and teaching instrument tables.

**e) designing the supervision indicators assessment rubric**

In the guideline book, there are two types of assessment indicators rubric. They are the indicators of teaching appraisal and indicators of teaching performance appraisal.

**f) Design validation**

Validation is carried out by 2 validators who are experienced in the field of educational supervision. Aspects that are validated include content aspects that include general material aspect and specific material aspect, language feature, presentation aspect, completeness of the presentation aspect and overall appearance aspect. From the two validators, with 40 items an indicator, the score results is 185.5 with a mean of 4.63 and a feasibility percentage of 92.75%

The researcher also calculated the mean score, the validation score and the percentage of eligibility in each aspect of the assessment. The results obtained are as follows.

1. Aspect of general material content, with a score of 41.00 with a mean total rating of 4.56 and a eligibility percentage of 91.11%
2. Aspect of specific material content, with a score of 73.00 with a mean total rating of 4.56 and a eligibility percentage of 91.25%
3. Linguistic aspects, with a score of 28.00 with a mean total rating of 4.67 and a eligibility percentage of 93.33%

4. Presentation aspects with a score of 9.5 with a total rating of 4.75 and a eligibility percentage of 95%
5. Completeness aspects of the presentation with a score of 24.50 with a mean total assessment of 4.9 and a eligibility percentage of 98%
6. Comprehensive display aspects with a score of 24.50 with a total average rating of 4.9 and a eligibility percentage of 98%

After getting a value and given input by experts, researchers make some improvements to some parts of the guide book

After being revised in certain parts, later products are brought to the principals. The trial was conducted by supervising teachers at the school by using the book "Clinical Supervision Guidelines Patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm".

Aspects used as trial evaluations include aspects of content (specific material), linguistic aspects, aspects of overall appearance, and aspects of product use. The data obtained is data in the form of questionnaires and interviews. The score obtained as 116.6 with the average assessment score of 4.49.

The results of the trial product of the book "Clinical Supervision Guideline patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm" are not only assessed in the form of numbers, but also get positive responses from subjects who are testing the use of the product.

To answer the 3 problems formulated in the chapter, there are 3 main points that will be elaborated in the discussion section, 1) relating to the analysis of things that are already good and need to be developed on products that have been used as a reference for supervision in Strada schools, 2) forms the product of Clinical Guidance Supervision Guidelines Patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm which will be used as a reference to carry out teaching supervision in Strada schools, and 3) product validation analysis in the form of Guidance for Clinical

Supervision Guidance patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm

First, the products that have been used in conducting supervision, the product itself has many advantages and disadvantages. Some disadvantages of the product are that the product is no longer relevant to use in Strada, because the product does not follow the development of learning carried out in Strada schools, namely the reflective pedagogical paradigm, besides that, it is seen from its completeness, the book does not contain the full supervision cycle, and assessment instruments contained in the manual are not presented with detailed assessment descriptions with exact numbers and quality, based on the deficiencies found in the product, the researchers designed a guidebook to cover the deficiencies found in the previous products, such as implement the assessment of teaching methods that are patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm on teaching performance appraisal instruments, provide technical guidance for the full supervision cycle, starting from supervision planning, supervision implementation, supervision evaluation, until the follow-up plan s revisions, make a description of assessment on each assessment score aspects that are contained in the teaching instrument assessment instrument and teaching performance appraisal instrument, assessment instruments are made with a definite score that is adjusted to the description of the quality in each aspects.

Second, the final appearance of the product in the form of a book Guidance for Clinical Supervision Guidance patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm, consists of the following parts 1) front cover, 2) general content, which includes preface, table of contents, list of figures and tables, references, 3) specific contents. Includes Chapters I through Chapter VI.

Chapter 1 contains background, legal basis and objectives. The background section contains



backgrounds that encourage researchers to develop a guidebook. Chapter 2 contains theories about clinical supervision and reflective pedagogical paradigm theories. Theories about clinical supervision include general concepts of clinical supervision, the purpose of clinical supervision, the stages of implementing clinical supervision. Chapter 3 consists of technical guidelines for supervision. Chapter 4 contains assessment indicators, which consist of assessing the teaching instrument and evaluating teaching performance. Not only indicators, this chapter also features a score description on each indicator that is useful to provide a guide for supervisors to provide ratings to supervisees. Chapter 5 contains the instruments for teaching instrument assessment and teaching performance assessment instruments that have been adjusted according to indicators and score descriptions in chapter 4, and Chapter 6 contains the final conclusions about the guidebook.

Third, This guideline book "Clinical Supervision Guideline Patterned on Reflective Pedagogical Paradigm" also goes through these two important stages so that their eligibility is known as a medium that can be used in the implementation of supervision. Calculation of 6 aspects of assessment namely the contents of the general material, the contents of the specific material, linguistic aspect, presentation aspect, completeness of the presentation aspect and overall appearance aspect with a total of 40 indicator items performed by 2 material experts showing the following results. The overall product rating score is 185,5 with an average rating score of 4.63. Based on the calculation of the range of values, the number 4.63 shows the value of this manual is excellent, while the product validation number shows the number 185,5, which means that overall this manual is very valid and the percentage number is at number 92.75. So, from the six aspects it can be

concluded that this product is very valid and deserves to be used as one of guideline in implementing supervision.

## CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this R&D research has passed eight stages to finally produces a product that is valid and eligible to be used. The product that has been produced is a guideline book of clinical supervision patterned on reflective pedagogical paradigm. This product is aimed to be used by the principal of Strada School in North Jakarta and East Jakarta as one of reference in conducting clinical supervision for the teachers.

The guideline book consists of 6 chapter which include, the background of supervision, the legal basis for supervision, and matters relating to clinical supervision, reflective pedagogical paradigm, technical guideline in implementing clinical supervision, assessment rubric, and supervision assessment instrument.

The guideline book of clinical supervision goes through a validation process and a limited trial process to find out whether the guideline book is valid and eligible to be used. The result of validation process from two experts show the number 185.5 which means that the product is valid and this guideline is also eligible to be use as one of reference in implementing clinical supervision. It is indicated by a percentage value of eligibility of 20%.

## REFERENCES

- Akhmad,dkk. 2014. Pengembangan Model Supervisi Klinis Dengan Pendekatan Lesson Study Untuk Meningkatkan Kompetensi Profesional Guru Bahasa Inggris SMA Negeri Di Kabupaten Cilacap. *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation*. Vol 3
- Danim. 2002. *Inovasi Pendidikan. Dalam Upaya Peningkatan*

- Aurelia dan Hotmaulina. *Clinical Supervision...*
- Profesionalisme Tenaga Kerja*.  
CV.Pustaka Setia : Bandung
- Mukhtar dan Iskandar. 2013. *Orientasi Baru Supervisi Pendidikan*. Jakarta : Gaung Persada Press Group
- Purwanto. 2014. *Administrasi dan Supervisi Pendidikan*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya
- Sahertian dan Mataheru, 1981. *Prinsip dan Tehnik Supervisi Pendidikan*. Surabaya: Usana Offset Printing
- Subagya, Triyana, et all. 2008. *Paradigma Pedagogik Reflektif*. IKAPI : Penerbit Kanisius
- Sugiyono, 2011. *Metode Penelitian dan R&D*. Bandung : Alfabeta.
- Setyowati, C. S. P., & Louis, I. S. Y. (2018, September). Implementation of reflective pedagogical paradigm approach on the rata of reaction to student achievement. In *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* (Vol. 1097, No. 1, p. 012057). IOP Publishing
- Selvi,K. (2010). Teachers' competencies. *Cultura Internasional Journal of Philosophy of Culture and Axiology*, 7(1), 167-175
- Zhu, C., Wang, D.,Y., & Engels,N. (2013). What core competencies are related to teachers' Innovative teaching?, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education* 41(1), 9-27
- Ghavifekr,S., Husain,H., Rosden,N.A.,& Hamat,Z.W. (2019) Clinical Supervision: Towards Effective Classroom Teaching. *MOJES: Malaysia Online Journal of Education Sciences*, 7(4), 30-42
- Fahmi, C.N., Murdiati,A.R.,Nurliza,E.,& Usman,N. (2019). The Implementation of Academic Supervision in Improving Teacher Competency at Primary School. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun*,7(1), 181-194.
- Sihotang, H., Limbong, M., Simbolon, B. R., Tampubolon, H., & Silalahi, M. (2019). Peningkatan Kompetensi Guru Dalam Mengimplementasikan Kurikulum 2013 Dalam Education 4.0. *JURNAL ComunitA Servizio: Jurnal Terkait Kegiatan Pengabdian kepada Masyarakat, terkhusus bidang Teknologi, Kewirausahaan dan Sosial Kemasyarakatan*, 1(2), 223-234.