

Trs: HTS External Review 9523 - Review Status Update

From: Demsy Jura (demsy.jura@uki.ac.id)

To: indoblessing@yahoo.com

Date: Thursday, February 8, 2024 at 03:36 PM GMT+7

Dari: aosis@hts.org.za <aosis@hts.org.za>

Dikirim: Jumat, 08 Desember 2023 14.38

Kepada: Demsy Jura <demsy.jura@uki.ac.id>; pantjar@gmail.com <pantjar@gmail.com>;
chrstar.indotec@gmail.com <chrstar.indotec@gmail.com>

Subjek: HTS External Review 9523 - Review Status Update

Ref. No.: 9523

Manuscript title: EMBRACING THE EMIC OF MINAHASA CELEBRATION CULTURE AND
CHRISTIAN RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

Journal: HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies

Dear Demsy Jura, Pantjar Simatupang, Chrstar Rumbay

Your blinded manuscript moved into the peer review process on 20-Oct-23 and
is still undergoing assessment by our expert independent reviewers. Read our
peer review process https://aosis.co.za/policies#peer_review.

We hope to receive an outcome of the finalisation of the review shortly,
which will be communicated by the assigned Review Editor, as our records
indicate that your manuscript has been in our review stage for 50 days.

Ensure to keep us informed if any of your credentials have changed during
this time, to ease communication with you as your manuscript progresses
through the different publication phases. If you need any assistance, kindly
contact the Editorial Office at submissions@hts.org.za with any questions or
concerns.

We remind our authors that our publisher is a member of CrossChecks
plagiarism detection initiative and endorses and applies the standards of
the Committee on Publication Ethics which promotes integrity in
peer-reviewed research publications. This journal also conforms to the
accreditation requirements by both the Department of Higher Education and
Training of South Africa and Scielo SA.

Thank you for your continued patience and support, and we hope you have
joined our online community by signing up to our RSS alerts and Twitter
page.

Kind regards
Ms De Bod
AOSIS colleague
Editorial Coordinator
Special Issues Unit
Scholarly Journals Department
AOSIS Publishing, Empowering Africa through access to knowledge

Tel: +270219752602

URL: website url of journal

reviewing interest: AOSIS colleague

HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies | <https://hts.org.za> |
ISSN: 0259-9422 (PRINT) | ISSN: 2072-8050 (ONLINE)

If you require immediate assistance, please contact AOSIS Publishing |
Tel: +27 21 975 2602 | Support email: publishing@aosis.co.za |
Business hours are weekdays between 8:00am-16:30pm

Interested in more Theological and Religious Studies research, visit:

- HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies [\[https://hts.org.za\]](https://hts.org.za) |
- In die Skriflig/In Luce Verbi [\[https://indieskriflig.org.za\]](https://indieskriflig.org.za) | •
- Verbum et Ecclesia [\[https://verbumetecclesia.org.za\]](https://verbumetecclesia.org.za) | • Theologia Viatorum [\[https://theologiaviatorum.org\]](https://theologiaviatorum.org)

Confidentiality: The information contained in and attached to this email is confidential and for use of the intended recipient. This email adheres to the email disclaimer described on <https://aosis.co.za>

Trs: HTS External Review Decision 9523 - Resubmit for review

From: Demsy Jura (demsy.jura@uki.ac.id)

To: indoblessing@yahoo.com

Date: Thursday, February 8, 2024 at 03:40 PM GMT+7

Dari: Demsy Jura <demsy.jura@uki.ac.id>

Dikirim: Kamis, 08 Februari 2024 15.39

Kepada: indoblessing@yahoo.com <indoblessing@yahoo.com>

Subjek: Trs: HTS External Review Decision 9523 - Resubmit for review

Dari: aosis@hts.org.za <aosis@hts.org.za>

Dikirim: Selasa, 30 Januari 2024 01.04

Kepada: Mr Charstar A. Rumbay <charstar.indotec@gmail.com>

Cc: Demsy Jura <demsy.jura@uki.ac.id>; Pantjar Simatupang <pantjar@gmail.com>

Subjek: HTS External Review Decision 9523 - Resubmit for review

Ref. No.: 9523

Manuscript title: EMBRACING THE EMIC OF MINAHASA CELEBRATION CULTURE AND
CHRISTIAN RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

Journal: HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies

Dear Mr Rumbay

We thank you for the submission of your manuscript. The editorial and peer reviews of your manuscript have now been completed and we have reached a decision regarding your submission.

As you can see from the comments included, the reviewers recommend significant revisions to your manuscript. We strongly encourage you to submit a revised version that addresses the reviewers' concerns.

Should you choose to revise the manuscript, please be sure to take into careful consideration the suggestions of the reviewers. Please include with your revised submission an itemised, point-by-point response to the reviewers which details the changes made. Please inform me should you plan on resubmitting a revision to the HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies - I would like to ensure a quick start of the next peer review round.

As a member of the Committee on Publication Ethics, we encourage your participation in assessing your Similarity Check Report in your journals' personalised manuscript section. Proceed to rewrite the paraphrased text or to introduce citations and acknowledgements as needed. Our assessment revealed:
report does not contain concern at this time.

The revised manuscript should be submitted by 19-Feb-24; if you anticipate that you will be unable to meet this deadline, please notify the Editorial Office.

Below my signature, you will find steps to resubmit your manuscript to the journal. If you need any assistance, kindly contact the Editorial Office at submissions@hts.org.za with any questions or concerns.

Yours sincerely,
 Prof Baron
 Department of Christian Spirituality, Church History and Missiology,
 University of South Africa

Frequently Asked Question

How do I view the reviewer comments, after formal peer review, if the Editor-in-Chief provided feedback regarding my article?

The editor should send you an email stating all the revisions suggested during the formal peer review process. If you are advised to download the comments via your personalised journal section, follow these steps:

- Log into your personalised journal section.
- Under your 'User Home' click on the 'Author' or 'Active' link that will direct you to your 'Active Submissions Table'.
- Under the 'Status Column', click on 'In Review: Revisions Required'. This link takes you to the overview of the peer review process.
- The review page of your article provides information and documentation under the heading 'Peer Review', and will identify files by reviewers, e.g. Reviewer B 19-123-1-RV.docx 2011-08-10. Download these documents to view the reviewer files.

Frequently Asked Question

The Editor-in-Chief has requested revisions to my article. How do I submit my revised version?

When the editor dealing with your submission chooses to ask for a revision, you will be notified by email. In the journals' personalised section your submission will move in the active table from the status 'In Review' to 'In Review: Revisions Required'.

When you prepare a revised version of your manuscript, it is essential that you carefully follow the instructions given in the editor's letter. Use the standard uploading format (as described for original submissions), but include both a clean copy of your manuscript and an annotated copy describing the changes you have made. Failure to do so will cause a delay in the review of your revision.

If references, tables, or figures are moved, added, or deleted during the revision process, renumber them to reflect such changes so that all tables, references and figures are cited in numeric order. Images need only be uploaded if changes have been made in the figures since the previous version.

The annotated copy should have highlights on the changes (either by using the 'Track Changes' function in Word or by highlighting or underlining text) with notes in the text referring to the editor or reviewer query (e.g. highlighted text [R2.2] would be the second comment from reviewer 2, and highlighted text [E1.4] would be the fourth comment from the editor). Be sure when you upload your annotated version that the changes are clearly visible in the Word (.doc) file prior to resubmission.

You should create a point-by-point response letter specifying how you have addressed each of the editor's and reviewer's comments.

Using the review version of your manuscript, edit and revise your submission according to the reviewers' and editor's comments, and follow the steps:

- When you have addressed the comments and completed your revisions, log into your journals' personalised section and click on 'In Review: Revisions Required'.
- Under the 'Editor Decision', click the bubble icon to view the editor's decision letter. If needed, you may view the original editor and

reviewer comments by clicking files linked under the 'Review Round'.

- Once your revisions are correctly formatted and prepared, click on 'Browse' to begin uploading your revised manuscript from your desktop. Ensure to upload a clean-, annotated and point-by-point version as part of your revised manuscript submission.

Once all three documents are uploaded, you will need to inform the editor via email of your resubmission. Click on the email icon and proceed to type and email the editor. remember to press 'Send'.

For a video detailing the uploading of your revised manuscript see here:

https://pkp.sfu.ca/files/author_submission_status_acadiau.mp4

Reviewer A:

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All comments you enter in this section will be provided verbatim to authors.

13. Summary of major findings and shortcomings?:

This paper holds significant relevance within the discourse of multiculturalism in Indonesia. Nevertheless, the research topic lacks a comprehensive elucidation of its background and significance within a wider framework. The article could have enhanced the introduction of the research topic by offering a more comprehensive elucidation of the educational milieu in Indonesia and the significance of incorporating indigenous culture into the curriculum.

Regarding the methods, there is still a deficiency in specificity. While it has been clarified that this article employs a qualitative methodology by drawing upon literary sources and ethnographic data, there is a need for a comprehensive elucidation of the specific method and its implementation in the research.

The results and discussion section lacks a comprehensive explanation regarding the specific impact of the cultural integration of the Minahasa Mapalus celebration on the Christian Religious Education (CHE) curriculum in Indonesia. While the article offers a thorough examination of the cultural assimilation of the Minahasa Mapalus celebration into the PAK curriculum, a more comprehensive elucidation of the practical execution of this assimilation could enhance the findings.

The article has incorporated a diverse range of pertinent literary sources and scholarly literature, including journals pertaining to Minahasan culture, ethnography, and Christian religious education. However, recent research has not been taken into account.

14. Major points that must be addressed?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

Here are some recommendations for enhancing the quality of the writing:

1. The significant context of this research is the need for multiculturalism in education as a response to the plural character of Indonesian society. This research needs to explain the history and importance of multicultural education in a broader context
2. Further elaboration is required in the presentation and analysis of written sources to provide a more comprehensive explanation of the utilization of qualitative methodology with literary text sources.
3. When examining the cultural influence of incorporating Mapalus into the Christian Religious Education (PAK) curriculum in Indonesia, it is necessary to provide practical and operational explanations for the implementation process.
4. In the "result and discussion" section, it is crucial to highlight the presentation of qualitative data obtained from written materials by providing a clear presentation of the data dimensions and analysis.
5. The literature utilized should incorporate more contemporary sources when discussing cultural integration (local) in religious education.

15. Minor points or recommended revisions?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

-

Reviewer B:

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All comments you enter in this section will be provided verbatim to authors.

13. Summary of major findings and shortcomings?:

This article raises an important issue in the discourse on Christian religious education, namely cultural accommodation. However, what is still lacking is the analysis and reconstruction of Minahasan cultural values into Christian Religious Education

14. Major points that must be addressed?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

1. The theme of Christian Religious Education is broad, and includes several sub-fields. One of them is the curriculum. In the abstract and introduction sections it is necessary to state what the curriculum wants to target with Minahasa cultural values.

2. In the discussion section, related to point 1 above, discussions regarding Minahasan cultural values with Christian religious education should focus on the curriculum.

15. Minor points or recommended revisions?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

1. Revisi teknis terutama tentang kutipan "wawancara" dari penelitian, yang menurut saya hanya harus dirujuk secara langsung sebagai hasil penelitian dari artikel yang direferensikan

Reviewer A:

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All comments you enter in this section will be provided verbatim to authors.

13. Summary of major findings and shortcomings?:

This paper holds significant relevance within the discourse of multiculturalism in Indonesia. Nevertheless, the research topic lacks a comprehensive elucidation of its background and significance within a wider framework. The article could have enhanced the introduction of the research topic by offering a more comprehensive elucidation of the educational milieu in Indonesia and the significance of incorporating indigenous culture into the curriculum.

Regarding the methods, there is still a deficiency in specificity. While it has been clarified that this article employs a qualitative methodology by drawing upon literary sources and ethnographic data, there is a need for a

comprehensive elucidation of the specific method and its implementation in the research.

The results and discussion section lacks a comprehensive explanation regarding the specific impact of the cultural integration of the Minahasa Mapalus celebration on the Christian Religious Education (CHE) curriculum in Indonesia. While the article offers a thorough examination of the cultural assimilation of the Minahasa Mapalus celebration into the PAK curriculum, a more comprehensive elucidation of the practical execution of this assimilation could enhance the findings.

The article has incorporated a diverse range of pertinent literary sources and scholarly literature, including journals pertaining to Minahasan culture, ethnography, and Christian religious education. However, recent research has not been taken into account.

14. Major points that must be addressed?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

Here are some recommendations for enhancing the quality of the writing:

1. The significant context of this research is the need for multiculturalism in education as a response to the plural character of Indonesian society. This research needs to explain the history and importance of multicultural education in a broader context
2. Further elaboration is required in the presentation and analysis of written sources to provide a more comprehensive explanation of the utilization of qualitative methodology with literary text sources.
3. When examining the cultural influence of incorporating Mapalus into the Christian Religious Education (PAK) curriculum in Indonesia, it is necessary to provide practical and operational explanations for the implementation process.
4. In the "result and discussion" section, it is crucial to highlight the presentation of qualitative data obtained from written materials by providing a clear presentation of the data dimensions and analysis.
5. The literature utilized should incorporate more contemporary sources when discussing cultural integration (local) in religious education.

15. Minor points or recommended revisions?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

-

Reviewer B:

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All comments you enter in this section will be provided verbatim to authors.

13. Summary of major findings and shortcomings?:

This article raises an important issue in the discourse on Christian religious education, namely cultural accommodation. However, what is still lacking is the analysis and reconstruction of Minahasan cultural values into Christian Religious Education

14. Major points that must be addressed?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

1. The theme of Christian Religious Education is broad, and includes several sub-fields. One of them is the curriculum. In the abstract and

introduction sections it is necessary to state what the curriculum wants to target with Minahasa cultural values.

2. In the discussion section, related to point 1 above, discussions regarding Minahasan cultural values with Christian religious education should focus on the curriculum.

15. Minor points or recommended revisions?

Please provide a numbered list to facilitate responses with the page and/or line numbers and detailed information on specific recommendations.:

1. Revisi teknis terutama tentang kutipan "wawancara" dari penelitian, yang menurut saya hanya harus dirujuk secara langsung sebagai hasil penelitian dari artikel yang direferensikan

HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies | <https://hts.org.za> |
ISSN: 0259-9422 (PRINT) | ISSN: 2072-8050 (ONLINE)

If you require immediate assistance, please contact AOSIS Publishing |
Tel: +27 21 975 2602 | Support email: publishing@aosis.co.za |
Business hours are weekdays between 8:00am-16:30pm

Interested in more Theological and Religious Studies research, visit:

• HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies [<https://hts.org.za>] |
• In die Skriflig/In Luce Verbi [<https://indieskriflig.org.za>] | •
Verbum et Ecclesia [<https://verbumetecclesia.org.za>] | • Theologia
Viatorum [<https://theologiaviatorum.org>]

Confidentiality: The information contained in and attached to this email is confidential and for use of the intended recipient. This email adheres to the email disclaimer described on <https://aosis.co.za>

Dari: aosis@hts.org.za <aosis@hts.org.za>

Dikirim: Selasa, 27 Februari 2024 20.06

Kepada: Demsy Jura <demsy.jura@uki.ac.id>; pantjar@gmail.com <pantjar@gmail.com>;
christar.indotec@gmail.com <christar.indotec@gmail.com>

Subjek: HTS 9523: Manuscript Accepted for Publication, Sent to Editing

Ref. No.: 9523

Manuscript title: Embracing the Emic of Minahasa Celebration Culture and
Christian Religious Education

Journal: HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies

Dear Demsy Jura, Pantjar Simatupang, Christar Rumbay

We are pleased to confirm your manuscript's acceptance for publication on
26-Feb-24.

We can also confirm that the Submission and Review Department released your
manuscript to our Finalisation Department to commence the various editing
processes to secure online publication within the next 90 days (if not
sooner).

Kindly note:

1. If you need to make contact with AOSIS Publishing during the finalisation stage of your manuscript, kindly contact us per email or phone.
2. The finalisation procedure works as follows: (a) The first stage is the language editing that is returned to the corresponding Author for review. This will be the final opportunity for the corresponding Author to make text changes to the manuscript. (b) At a later stage, the editorial staff will send the corresponding author one set of galley proofs, at which time the Author will have two working days to mark any typographical errors.
3. Manuscript tracking is available on the submitting authors' journal profile. The submitting Author could visit their home page frequently to assess the stage of the manuscript.

Thank you for your continued patience and support, and we hope you have joined our online community by signing up to our RSS alerts and Twitter page.

Kind regards,

Ms De Bod

AOSIS colleague

Editorial Coordinator

Special Issues Unit

Scholarly Journals Department

AOSIS Publishing, Empowering Africa through access to knowledge

Tel: +270219752602

URL: website url of journal

reviewing interest: AOSIS colleague

HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies | <https://hts.org.za> |
ISSN: 0259-9422 (PRINT) | ISSN: 2072-8050 (ONLINE)

If you require immediate assistance, please contact AOSIS Publishing |
Tel: +27 21 975 2602 | Support email: publishing@aosis.co.za |
Business hours are weekdays between 8:00am-16:30pm

Interested in more Theological and Religious Studies research, visit:

- HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies [<https://hts.org.za>] |
- In die Skriflig/In Luce Verbi [<https://indieskriflig.org.za>] | •
- Verbum et Ecclesia [<https://verbumetecclesia.org.za>] | • Theologia Viatorum [<https://theologiaviatorum.org>]

Confidentiality: The information contained in and attached to this email is confidential and for use of the intended recipient. This email adheres to the email disclaimer described on <https://aosis.co.za>