



## Submit Article for Al-Ishlah

1 pesan

Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>  
Kepada: jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com

20 Juni 2023 13.47

Dear

**Editor Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah)**

I have read and used scientific articles published in AL-ISHLAH.

The performance of the AL-ISHLAH was excellent, and the published article helped me conduct research and write scientific reports.

I am Dirk Roy Kolibu, from Universitas Kristen Indonesia.

I have completed a scientific article entitled ***"Teogogy Nationalistic: An Interaction Model of Christian Religious Education in a Multicultural Society in the Digital Era."***

I hope this article can be published in the AL-ISHLAH because exciting findings in the scientific report can become new treasures in science, especially in education sciences.

I am willing to go through the review process following AL-ISHLAH standards.

Warm Regards,

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia



Al-Ishlah\_Submit\_Maksimus.doc

75K



## Acknowledgement of Manuscript Submission

1 pesan

**Widia Yunita** <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

21 Juni 2023 14.17

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

The AL-ISHLAH Editorial Board has received the article.  
I appreciate the interest in AL-ISHLAH.

The article will be processed according to the publication standards at AL-ISHLAH.  
I beg you to be patient while waiting for the notification from the AL-ISHLAH Editorial Board.

Always check email because the correspondence is only via email.

Sincerely,

--

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board Al-Ishlah



## Author Response to Manuscript Submission

1 pesan

Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

23 Juni 2023 14.28

Kepada: Widia Yunita <jurnalpendidikanlshlah@gmail.com>

Dear

**Editor Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah)**

Thank you for your response.

I am happy to wait for the next stage.

Warm Regards,

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia



## Decision on Manuscript Submission – Initial Review Feedback

1 pesan

Widia Yunita <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

27 Juni 2023 18.43

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

Thank you for submitting the manuscript to AL-ISHLAH.

I have completed our evaluation, and the reviewers recommend reconsidering the manuscript following minor revisions. Please resubmit the revised manuscript by April 21<sup>th</sup>, 2023, or ask whether an alternate date would be acceptable. We invite you to send it back after addressing the comments below.

When revising the manuscript, consider carefully all issues mentioned in the reviewers' comments: outline every change made in response to their comments and provide suitable explanations for any remarks not addressed. Please also note that the revised submission may need to be reviewed.

To submit a revised manuscript, please log in as an author at this email, and navigate to the "Revision" folder. AL-ISHLAH values team contribution, and I look forward to receiving the revised manuscript.

Editor and reviewer comments:

Reviewer 1: Focus on Theoretical Clarity & Structure

- 1. Clarification of the Term "Nationalistic Theogogy":** The manuscript introduces a novel concept, "nationalistic theogogy," but it lacks a clear definition and theoretical grounding. Please elaborate on the conceptual framework and differentiate it from existing paradigms in Christian pedagogy and multicultural education.
- 2. Integration Between Theology and Pedagogy:** While the abstract mentions a combination of theology and pedagogy, the body of the paper needs to show concrete examples of how theological principles directly inform pedagogical strategies in multicultural settings. Including case studies or practical scenarios could enhance clarity.
- 3. Ambiguity in Use of "Digital Era" Disruptions:** The abstract refers to "disruptions" in the digital era without specifying what these disruptions entail. Are they technological, cultural, moral, or institutional? The paper would benefit from a clearer exploration of these challenges and how the proposed model addresses them.

Reviewer 2: Focus on Methodology & Practical Application

- 1. Methodological Transparency Needed:** The abstract mentions the use of a qualitative descriptive method, but details on sampling, data collection techniques, and participant characteristics are missing. Please clarify how the data were obtained and analyzed to improve the study's credibility and replicability.
- 2. Practical Implementation of the Model:** The article should discuss how this proposed model can be implemented in real-world Christian education settings—such as schools, churches, or online platforms. Concrete recommendations or best practices would enhance its practical value.
- 3. Cultural Diversity Considerations Are Too General:** The manuscript refers broadly to "cultural and religious diversity," but it doesn't provide specific examples or contexts (e.g., interfaith tensions, ethnic group relations in specific regions). A deeper dive into localized multicultural dynamics would make the discussion richer.

I hope you can make improvements as soon as possible and send the revised article again via this email.

Sincerely,

--

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board Al-Ishlah



Al-Ishlah\_Maksimus\_Review1.doc

77K



## Author Response to Reviewers Comments

1 pesan

**Dirk Roy Kolibu** <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

28 Juni 2023 19.22

Kepada: Widia Yunita <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>

Dear

**Editor Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah)**

Thank you for the Editorial Board response to AL-ISHLAH.  
I have read the revised instructions from the reviewers.  
I will immediately correct the article according to the reviewers.

Warm Regards,

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia



## First Revised Manuscript Submission

1 pesan

**Dirk Roy Kolibu** <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

6 Juli 2023 09.10

Kepada: Widia Yunita <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>

Dear

**Editor Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah)**

Thank you for the patience of the AL-ISHLAH Editorial Board.

I was waiting for the revision of my article.

I have made improvements according to the reviewer's two reviewer instructions.

I will be happy if there are still points that need further improvement in the article.

The revised Article is Attached.

Warm Regards,

Dirk Roy Kolibu

Universitas Kristen Indonesia



**Al-Ishlah\_Maksimus\_Revised1.doc**

76K



## Response Review First Revised Received

1 pesan

**Widia Yunita** <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

9 Juli 2023 13.09

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

Thank you for submitting the revised version of your manuscript.

We appreciate the substantial improvements made to the manuscript and the thorough responses to reviewers.

Your manuscript has now been sent back to the original reviewers for a first round of evaluation.

You will be notified once we receive the final recommendations.

Sincerely,

--

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board Al-Ishlah



## Reviewer Feedback – Second Round Review

1 pesan

Widia Yunita <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

22 Agustus 2023 16:57

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

We have now received the second-round review of your manuscript. The reviewers noted a significant improvement in the clarity and academic quality of your work. However, a few minor revisions are still required before final acceptance.

Here is a summary of remaining points:

### Reviewer 1 Comments:

- **On the Definition and Positioning of "Nationalistic Theogogy":** While the author has added a brief definition of "nationalistic theogogy," the concept still feels loosely constructed and somewhat abstract. To solidify its academic contribution, I recommend clearly situating it within existing theological-pedagogical paradigms—perhaps by drawing contrasts or synergies with liberation theology, intercultural theology, or indigenous pedagogical approaches. Without this anchoring, the term risks remaining vague and ungrounded.
- **The Missing Visual Framework of the Interaction Model:** Despite previous suggestions, the manuscript still lacks a visual representation or structural diagram of the proposed interaction model. This is a missed opportunity to communicate the complexity and interrelation of concepts such as morality, inclusivity, national identity, and digital engagement. Even a simple conceptual map would significantly increase the clarity and academic utility of the article.

### Reviewer 2 Comments:

- **On Methodological Rigor and Sampling Description:** Although the author has expanded the methodology section, the description of the sampling technique remains vague. For example, it is still unclear how participants were selected, whether purposive or theoretical sampling was used, and how many individuals were involved in the study. Providing this detail is essential to assess the trustworthiness and transferability of the findings.
- **Practical Application of Communication Skills in Digital Contexts:** The revision adds a section on communication skills, but it remains theoretical. Given the emphasis on digital-era Christian education, it would strengthen the article to provide at least one practical example or case illustrating how communication skills are developed or challenged in digital spaces (e.g., online Bible study forums, faith-based webinars, or interfaith digital dialogues).

Please address these revisions and resubmit your updated manuscript and response letter within 7 days.

Sincerely,

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board AI-Ishlah

 **AI-Ishlah\_Maksimus\_Review2.doc**  
76K





---

**Response Author – Second Round Minor Revised**1 pesan

---

**Dirk Roy Kolibu** <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

15 September 2023 16:57

Kepada: Widia Yunita &lt;jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com&gt;

Dear

**Editor Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah)**

I am pleased to submit the revised article version of manuscript as requested.  
All minor revisions have been addressed accordingly.

Please find attached:

- Final Revised Manuscript
- Final Response Letter

We sincerely thank you for your continued support and guidance.

Warm Regards,

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia



---

**Al-Ishlah\_Maksimus\_Revised2.doc**

77K



---

## Manuscript Decision – Accepted Pending Formatting

1 pesan

---

**Widia Yunita** <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

24 September 2023 09.32

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

We are pleased to inform you that your manuscript entitled “**Teogogy Nationalistic: An Interaction Model of Christian Religious Education in a Multicultural Society in the Digital Era**” has been accepted for publication in the Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah).

At this stage, only minor formatting and typesetting adjustments remain.

Our production team will follow up with you shortly for the final proofing process.

Congratulations, and thank you for choosing Jurnal Pendidikan (Al-Ishlah).

Sincerely,

--

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board Al-Ishlah



---

**ACCEPTANCE LETTER**

1 pesan

---

**Widia Yunita** <jurnalpendidikanalishlah@gmail.com>  
Kepada: Dirk Roy Kolibu <dirk.kolibu@uki.ac.id>

25 September 2023 09.32

Dear

Dirk Roy Kolibu  
Universitas Kristen Indonesia

Warm Greetings!

**ACCEPTANCE LETTER**

It's a great pleasure to inform you that, after the peer review process, the **"Teogogy Nationalistic: An Interaction Model of Christian Religious Education in a Multicultural Society in the Digital Era"** article has been **Accepted** for publication in the AL-ISHLAH Regular Issue 2023. Please make a payment publication fee.

Thank you for submitting the paper to this journal. We hope to receive it in the future too.

Sincerely,

--

Widia Yunita  
Editorial Board Al-Ishlah



**LoA\_Al-Ishlah\_Maksimus.pdf**  
128K