

# The effect of learning opportunity factors and efficacy belief on mathematical knowledge

## in the teaching process

Jitu Halomoan Lumbantoruan 回

Mathematics education, Universitas Kristen Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia

#### ABSTRACT

The present study investigates the influence of opportunities to learn (OTL) and mathematics teaching efficacy beliefs (MTEB) towards mathematical knowledge for teaching (MKT). Using a structured questionnaire together with paper and pencil test adapted from the literature reviewed, data were collected from 187 pre-service elementary teachers in Institute of Teacher Education Indonesia. Data were analyzed using Smart PLS 3.0. The result of the structural equation model indicated that both OTL-Practicum ( $\beta = 0.395$ , p < 0.001) and OTL-Program ( $\beta = 0.324$ , p < 0.001) were positively related to MKT. The second regression analysis was to examine the impact of mathematics teaching efficacy belief on the MKT. The results showed that mathematics teaching outcome expectancy belief (MTOEB) ( $\beta = 0.322$ , p < 0.001) was not related to MKT. Overall, the belief and OTL factors explain a total of 54% variance in MKT. Implications from these findings to the successful teacher's education program implementation in Indonesia were further elaborated.

**KEYWORDS** 

Learning Opportunities; Expectations of teaching mathematics

Received: 26 April 2023 Accepted: 8 May 2023 Published: 9 May 2023

## Introduction

Teachers are individuals who are responsible for implementing the effective teaching and learning process (PdP) to ensure that students master every skill contained in the mathematics curriculum (Wildeman et al., 2022). The knowledge possessed by the teacher plays a role in ensuring the effective implementation of PdP activities and subsequently able to improve students' mathematical performance (Andersson & Palm, 2017). The low level of mastery of mathematics content knowledge and pedagogy among teachers will indirectly contribute to the implementation of the mathematics PdP process which is less effective (Volk et al., 2017). Mathematical Knowledge for Teaching (PMUP) is the concept of mathematical knowledge that teachers need to teach effectively. It includes evaluating the student's response, answering the questions presented by students, preparing assignments and making lesson plans (Musgrave & Carlson, 2017). According to Mohsenpour et al., (2021) the PMUP concept developed by Ball et al. (2008) is a multi-dimensional construct consisting of content knowledge (KK) and content pedagogical knowledge (PPK).

The Teacher Education Development Study in Mathematics (TEDS-M) was conducted by the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) in 2008 on 17 countries to provide information related to the knowledge of prospective primary and secondary school teachers throughout their education program. Teachers (Ingvarson & Rowley, 2017). Indonesia is one of the countries involved in the study. A total of 524 primary school pre-service teachers and 388 junior secondary pre-service teachers who are in their final year of study were involved in the study (Leong et al., 2015). The findings of the study released in 2012 show that the level of mastery of PMUP among pre-service teachers in Indonesia is low (Senk et al., 2012). Apart from the findings of the TEDS-M study in 2008 as explained by (Blömeke et al., 2022), studies by Hainora Hamzah et al., (2022), and (Zulkpli et al., 2017) also found that the level of knowledge mastery of mathematics teachers in Indonesia is low.

The low level of mastery of PMUP among teachers also affects the success of a teacher education program provided. According to (Tatto et al., 2015), the knowledge possessed by pre-service teachers at the end of the teaching course is the main indicator of the success of the teacher education program that has been followed. The Indonesian Ministry of Education (KPM) has allocated a large amount of money every year to the Teacher Education Institute (IPG) to ensure that the teacher education programs offered are capable of producing quality teachers (Napitupulu et al., 2017). If the PMUP level among teachers at the end of the teaching course is low, this illustrates that the teacher education program followed is less effective in producing competent teachers and subsequently causes the return on

CONTACT Jitu Halomoan Lumbantoruan 🛞 jituhalomoan.lumbantoruan@gmail.com

© 2023 The Author(s). Published with license by Lighthouse Publishing

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial NoDerivatives License (http:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by-ncnd/4.0/), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited, and is not altered, transformed, or built upon in any way.

the investment made by the Ministry of Education to be not worthwhile. In order to address the issue, there is a need to conduct a study to identify the factors that influence the mastery of PMUP among pre-service teachers in IPG.

Personal (KEPMP) tested. In addition, Tajudin et al., (2017) suggested that teachers' PPK should also be linked to opportunities to learn (PUB) innovative teaching strategies. Simsek and (Lorscheider et al., 2016) also suggested that factors such as gender, age and the opportunity to follow teaching training should also be taken into account. Based on the recommendations given by previous researchers, this study will test the influence of the Belief in Efficacy of Mathematics Teaching (KEPM) and PUB factors on PMUP. Thus, based on the PMUP model by (Richardson, 2013), this study will test the conceptual model of the study by integrating the PMUP model, Social Cognitive Theory by Bandura (1989a; 1989b) as well as several sets of variables related to PUB obtained from the literature reviewto study the influence of PUB factors and efficacy beliefs towards PMUP among pre-service teachers in IPG.

## Methods

The theory that is the basis of this study is the PMUP model by Liu et al., (2020). This theory was chosen based on its suitability to measure the level of mastery of PK and PPK mathematics among pre-service teachers. The PMUP theory was also used by previous researchers to measure the mastery level of mathematics teachers' knowledge. Among them is a study by Shabana et al., (2017) who studied the perception of pre-service teachers related to the course they followed and its effect on mathematics PPK. In addition, (De Costa & Norton, 2017) also used the PMUP model to study the relationship between the level of confidence and mathematics PK and PPK among trainee teachers. Other researchers who also use the PMUP model in their studies are Gesser-Edelsburg & Shahbari, (2017), Qian & Youngs, (2016), Pape et al., (2015), Kleickmann et al., (2015), Venkat & Spaull, (2015), Hine et al., (2015), Mei et al., (2015), Fauskanger, (2016), Thanheiser et al., (2013), and Senk et al., (2012). PMUP covers three categories of knowledge related to teacher PK:

- 1. Content Knowledge (PK), which is mathematical knowledge and skills that are not only specialized for teaching mathematics.
- 2. Specific Content Knowledge (PKK), which is unique mathematical knowledge and skills specific to teaching mathematics.
- 3. Horizon Content Knowledge (PKH), which is the awareness of the relationship between each topic in mathematics (Alteio et al., 2021).

In addition, PMUP also consists of three categories of knowledge related to PPK:

- 1. Content and Student-related Knowledge (PKPel), which is knowledge related to students' mathematical thinking, which requires interaction between specific mathematical understanding and understanding of students' mathematical thinking.
- 2. Knowledge related to Content and Teaching (PKP), which is knowledge related to teaching design, which requires interaction between understanding mathematics and understanding related to pedagogical issues that affect student learning.
- 3. Knowledge related to Content and Curriculum (KKK), which is knowledge related to teaching materials and programs (Lertlumnaphakul et al., 2022).

This study also integrates theories related to teacher efficacy beliefs. Social Cognitive Theory by Mozahem & Adlouni, (2021) was chosen to be used in this study. The theory was chosen because of the appropriateness of the variables to explain the influence of the belief factor in the effectiveness of mathematics teaching on pre-service teachers' mastery of PK and PPK mathematics. This is based on the findings of studies by Ekstam et al., (2017), De Costa & Norton, (2017), Oppermann et al., (2016), Travis et al., (2015), and Hughes et al., (2019). According to Oxelgren et al., (2017), there is an indirect relationship between teacher efficacy beliefs and PK. Meanwhile, findings from a study by De Costa & Norton, (2017) also found that there is a significant relationship between the level of teacher confidence and mathematics PK. Studies by Adam et al., (2016), Travis et al., (2015) and Sutton & Austin, (2015) also found that there is a relationship between efficacy beliefs and teacher knowledge. Apart from the PMUP model and teacher efficacy beliefs, the researcher will also test the effect of the opportunity factor to learn (PUB) or better known as Opportunity to Learn (OTL). This factor has been selected based on the findings of previous studies which found that the PUB factor plays a role in influencing teachers' mastery of PK and PPK. Among them is a study by Höhn et al., (2017), Jen&en et al., (2019), and Qian & Youngs, (2016). Nevertheless, the influence of the PUB factor on teachers' mastery of knowledge from previous studies is mostly concentrated among language teachers abroad, especially in Europe.

After examining the research literature and identifying relevant and appropriate theories, the researcher formed a research model as shown in Figure 1. The variable of efficacy beliefs is represented by the variables Belief in the Efficacy of Personal Mathematics Teaching (KEPMP) and Belief in Expected Results of Mathematics Teaching (KJHPM). The PUB variables consist of the opportunity to undergo teaching training (PUB- Praktikum) and the opportunity to follow a coherent teacher education program (PUB-Program). A study conducted has proven that KEPMP factors affect the dominance of PMUP. In addition, studies by Mathelier et al., (2016) and Hart et al., (2009) also found that KEPMP and KJHPM factors influence teachers' mastery of PPK mathematics. A study by Swars et al., (2007) also found that there is a significant relationship between KEPMP and KJHPM with pre-service teachers' mastery of

mathematics PK. Therefore, this study will examine the influence of KEPM factors on PMUP among pre-service teachers in IPG.

- H1: Belief in Personal Mathematics Teaching Efficacy (KEPMP) has a significant direct effect with mastery of PMUP
- H2: Beliefs and Expectations of Mathematics Teaching Outcomes (KJHPM)

Past studies prove that the PUB variable affects teachers' mastery of PK and PPK. Among them, a study by Höhn et al., (2017) on prospective secondary school English teachers found that PUB of content and PUB of teaching training had influenced their mastery of PPK. Regression analysis shows that PUB can positively predict the PPK test scores of trainee teachers with a  $\beta$  value equal to 0.28 (p < 0.01) for PUB content, and a  $\beta$  value equal to 0.29 (p < 0.01) for PUB teaching training (practicum). In addition, a study by Yeşildere & Akkoç, (2010) also found that PUB teaching training (practicum) significantly affects teachers' PPK mastery. A study by Yeşildere & Akkoç, (2010) and Senk et al., (2012) on pre-service teachers also found that the opportunity to follow a coherent teacher education program (PUB-Program) also affected teachers' mastery of PK and PPK. This clearly shows that PUB is an important factor that affects the mastery of knowledge and academic achievement of prospective teachers. Therefore, this study will also examine the influence of PUB on the dominance of PMUP among pre-service teachers in IPG.

- H3: Opportunity to undergo teaching training (PUB-Practicum) have a significant direct effect with the mastery of PMUP
- H4: The opportunity to follow a coherent teacher education program (PUB- Program) has a significant direct impact with PMUP

#### Data Collection Methods

The data collection method used is to conduct a survey using a questionnaire on 187 pre-service teachers at IPG. Before conducting the survey, the researcher first prepared a set of questionnaires that contained the information needed to answer the research questions that had been submitted. The questionnaire consists of three parts. The first part contains questions related to demographic information, the second part contains questions related to teacher efficacy beliefs and the last part consists of information related to PUB. Apart from that, the researcher also used a pencil and paper test to obtain data related to the PMUP level. A cluster random sampling method was used to select the study respondents. The questionnaire used was adapted from previous studies relevant to this study. Because the instruments used have met the aspects of validity and reliability, then the aspects of content validity have been met (Sanchez-Franco & Roldán, 2010). In addition, the researcher has also referred to several experts to ensure that the instrument used is valid in terms of its content. The value of the content validity index (I-CVI) shows that all items are valid because the value exceeds 0.70 (Ã & El-masri, 2005). The formation of research tools to measure PMUP variables was adapted. The items to measure the PMUP of pre-service teachers consist of 15 items related to mathematics PK and 17 items that test mathematics PPK. For items that test math PK, 4 items are from common content knowledge domains and 11 items are from specific content knowledge domains. While for the items that test the mathematics PPK, 13 items consist of knowledge domains related to content and students and another 4 items from knowledge domains related to content and teaching. Instrument to measure the KEPM variable was adapted from. (Matney et al., 2016). The instrument consists of two dimensions, namely KEPMP and KJHPM. The instrument contains 21 items in total, namely 13 items related to KEPMP and 8 items related to KJHPM.

#### Data Analysis

Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 23 software was used for descriptive analysis. Descriptive analysis was used to obtain information such as mean values, percentages, standard deviations, normality tests, missing data analysis and multivariate hypothesis tests. Normality testing, missing data analysis and multivariate hypothesis tests. Normality testing analysis is conducted. Smart PLS 3.0 software was used to analyze the data to test the research hypothesis. Two data analysis procedures were used in this study as suggested by Hair et al., (2017) namely measurement model evaluation and structural model evaluationdata.

#### Results

According to Larabi et al., (2019) hypothesis testing will only be conducted if the measurement model reaches the desired level of reliability and validity. To assess the reliability of each study variable, Cronbach's alpha and Composite Reliability values were used. Based on the analysis that has been carried out, it was found that Cronbach's alpha value for each construct exceeds 0.7, which is the minimum level (Holmbeck & Devine, 2009). In addition, the researcher also referred to the Composite Reliability value to determine the reliability of each construct. Based on the analysis that has been carried out, it was found that the Composite Reliability value for all constructs is above 0.7, so it is acceptable. Construct validity testing is conducted through the assessment of Convergent Validity and Discriminant Validity aspects. A variable is considered to have convergent validity if three criteria are met, first, the factor loading value of all individual items must exceed 0.708. However, items that have factor loading values between 0.4 to 0.7 can be considered to be retained (Chen et al., 2021). Based on the findings of the study in Table 1, it was found that there are some items that have factor loading values that are less than 0.708 but those items are retained because by removing the item in question (in bold) it does not increase the AVE value and composite reliability of the construct in question (As et al., 1968). Second, the composite reliability value is not less than 0.6 and thirdly the AVE value must be above 0.5 (Dash & Paul, 2021).

Construct	Ite m	Internal	Factor	Composite Averag
			(Cronbach's	
		alpha)		<sub>e</sub> Varianc
		0.010	0.001	Extracted
PUB-Practicum PUB_Prak1		0.916	0.801	0.9320.631
	PUB_Practic		0.830	
	e2			
	PUB_Prak3		0.863	
	PUB_Prak4		0.808	
	PUB_Prak5		0.770	
	PUB_Prak6		0.780	
	PUB_Prak7		0.741	
	PUB_Prak8		0.752	
PUB-Program	PUB_Prog1	0.896	0.790	0.9210.660
	PUB_Prog2		0.730	
	PUB_Prog3		0.870	
	PUB_Prog4		0.815	
	PUB_Prog5		0.823	
	PUB_Prog6		0.840	

Table 2. Summar	y of research l	nypothesis testing
-----------------	-----------------	--------------------

Hypothesis	b	t-value	Decision
(H1) KEPMP PMUP	0.017	0.284	Nope
(H2) KJHPM PMUP	0.322	5,669	Yes
(H3) PUB-Practicum PMUP	0.395	6,853	Yes
(H4) PUB-Program PMUP	0.324	5.179	Yes
(H5) PUB-Practicum KEPMP	0.277 *	3,745	Yes
(H6) PUB-Program KEPMP	0.260	3.256	Yes
(H7) PUB-Practicum KJHPM	0.024	0.281	Nope
(H8) PUB-Program KJHPM	0.108	1.244	Nope

*Note:*\*p value < 0.001

### Discussion

This study was conducted to examine the factors that influence PMUP among pre-service teachers in Indonesia. This study has tested the influence of KEPM and PUB factors on PMUP and the influence of PUB factors on teachers' KEPM. Based on the analysis conducted, it was found that the KJHPM factor has a significant relationship with PMUP ( $\beta = 0.322$ , p < 0.001). This finding confirms that pre-service teachers who have a high positive KJHPM will also master the PMUP learned while attending the teacher education program at IPG. This finding confirms that pre-service teachers who have a high KEPM will also master the PMUP learned while attending the PMUP learned while attending the Teacher education program at IPG.

There are several possibilities that cause KJHPM factors to play a role in influencing the level of pre-service teachers' mastery of PMUP. Among them is because they believe that effective teaching methods can affect students' mathematics achievement (Hwang et al., 2021). Pre-service teachers' beliefs regarding the importance of effective teaching may have influenced their PMUP to some extent. This is because according to Blazar, (2015), effective teaching activities can influence student achievement. For example, if a teacher believes that effective teaching can contribute

to students' mathematics achievement, then this will encourage them to study PMUP to ensure that they can teach more effectively in the future. Findings from testing this hypothesis are supported by some findings from previous studies. Among the findings from the study by Swars et al. (2007; 2009) who found that KJHPM is one of the factors that influence the PMUP of pre-service teachers in the United States. However, it is different for the findings of the study by Newton, Evans, Eastburn and Leonard (2007) showing that the KJHPM factor does not affect the teacher's PMUP. As the party responsible for training pre-service teachers who will serve as primary school mathematics teachers, IPGM should take some necessary steps to ensure that the level of KJHPM can be improved? The increase in the level of KJHPM is important because it is one of the factor obtained while following the teacher education program at IPG, other factors which identified to influence their KJHPM is emotional intelligence (Alrajhi et al., 2017). Therefore, it is suggested that the IPGM can design a mathematics education curriculum that can stimulate the emotional intelligence of pre-service teachers in the future.

In addition, according to Lotter et al. (2016) and Pape et al. (2015) on the other hand, the level of belief in teacher efficacy can be increased through professional development programs. While following the teacher education program at IPG, the trainee teachers were exposed to various courses to ensure they are able to become competent teachers in the future. Therefore, the IPGM is suggested to redouble its efforts to provide more robust professional development courses and programs to ensure that the level of confidence in the efficacy of pre-service teachers can be increased and indirectly contribute to an increase in their mastery of PMUP. Findings from the hypothesis testing that has been carried out show that the PUB factor has the strongest positive relationship with the PMUP of pre-service teachers in IPG. More information about the results of the analysis carried out has been displayed in Table 3. This finding confirms that pre-service teachers who obtain a high positive PUB will also master the PMUP learned while attending the teacher education program at IPG. Based on the analysis that has been carried out, it is also found that the PUB factor among pre-service teachers is explained by the opportunity factor to undergo teaching training more dominantly ( $\beta = 0.395$ , p < 0.001) than the opportunity factor to follow a coherent teacher education program ( $\beta = 0.325$ , p < 0.001).

According to Gerasimovaet al. (2017), the balance between theory and practice is important to produce quality prospective teachers in the future. Every pre-service teacher at IPG has been given sufficient opportunities to deepen knowledge either in terms of theory or practice. The curriculum designed by the IPGM covers all aspects to ensure that the potential teachers produced are able to compete and can successfully educate students. In addition, the opportunity to undergo teaching training (practicum) for two phases, which is about three months for each phase with the guidance of experienced lecturers and mentors, also contributed to some extent to the perception of preservice teachers related to PUB obtained during the education program teacher at IPG. This is because according to Toh, Berinderjeet and Koay (2009), the period of undergoing sufficient teaching training can affect the level of mastery of PMUP of pre-service teachers. This finding confirms that pre-service teachers who obtaining a high positive PUB will also master the PMUP learned while following the teacher education program at IPG.

This finding is supportedby some findings from previous studies. A study by Adamson (2012) found that PUB is one of the factors that influence the PMUP of pre-service teachers. A study by Ayieko et al., (2014) also found that PUB factors have influenced teachers' knowledge. In addition, a study conducted by Livy et al., (2016) on two preservice teachers in Australia also found that practicum experience is an important factor that can help them form mathematical PK. Findings from a study by Tatto, (2015) showed that there is a significant relationship between PUB obtained by in-service teachers while following a teacher education program and PMUP. The study was conducted on pre-service teachers in several countries using data from the IEA. Meanwhile, a study by Qian & Youngs, (2016) conducted on teachers in five countries using TEDS-M data also found that the PUB factor affects the knowledge mastery of a pre-service teacher. Findings from other studies also support the findings of this study, including studies by Blömeke et al., (2017) and (Höhn et al., 2017). Findings from a study conducted by Blömeke & Delaney, (2012) showed that there is a significant relationship between PUB and PMUP of pre-service teachers. The study was conducted on pre-service in Germany. Meanwhile, a study by Höhn et al., (2017) also conducted by Livy & Downton, (2018) for teachers in Australia also found that PUB factors affect teachers' PMUP. In addition, a study by Murray, Durkin, Chao and Star (2018) also shows that there is a significant relationship between PUB factors affect teachers' PMUP.

IPGM's role as an institution responsible for producing competent mathematics teachers, is a sign from the Ministry of Education and Culture to provide sufficient allocations to ensure that the widest possible PUB can be enjoyed by pre-service teachers. Apart from providing opportunities to undergo practicum and coherent teacher education programs, pre-service teachers should also be given opportunities to learn knowledge related to pedagogy more effectively. The opportunity factor to learn knowledge related to general pedagogy and mathematics pedagogy can influence the level of knowledge mastery of pre-service teachers. The delivery of knowledge related to pedagogy to pre-service teachers is directly related to the structure of the curriculum and the quality of lecturers. Therefore, in order to guarantee the delivery of knowledge related to pedagogy more effectively, it is suggested that the IPGM always update the mathematics education curriculum and at the same time also carry out continuous efforts to improve the competence of mathematics lecturers in the delivery of knowledge related to pedagogy (mathematics)

education). Findings from testing H5 and H6 show that the PUB factor has a positive relationship with KEPM. More information from the analysis conducted has been displayed in Table 3. This finding confirms that pre-service teachers who obtain a high positive PUB will also influence their KEPM. This situation may occur due to the experience that pre-service teachers go through while following the teacher education program has influenced their self-efficacy beliefs. For example, the experience of going through school-based experiential programs, micro-teaching exercises and practicum experiences have led them to believe that student learning is influenced by effective teaching (KJHPM). In addition, the experiences they have had while following the teacher education program are also likely to have caused them to feel more confident about their ability to teach (KEPMP). This finding is supported by some findings from previous studies. Among the findings from the study by Koszycki et al., (2010) who found that PUB is one of the factors that influence the KEPM of pre-service teachers. Findings from other studies also support the findings of this study, including a study by Philippou et al., (2021)who also found that the opportunity factor to follow a coherent teacher education program affects teachers' KEPM. A recent study conducted by Berger et al., (2018) on 154 vocational teachers also found that the factor of teaching experience (PUB-Practicum) affects teachers' efficacy beliefs.

## Limitations and Suggestions for Future Research

Research related to teacher knowledge is an ongoing and developing field of study. Based on the critical analysis that has been carried out, it was found throughout the year 2017 until June 2018, there are already almost 30 studies related to teacher knowledge published in selected journals. This clearly proves that research related to teacher knowledge is important and is the focus of researchers around the world. According to Ren et al., (2018), more research is needed in the future to explain how mathematics knowledge and teachers' beliefs are interrelated with each other. This study only focuses on the factors that affect PMUP among pre-service teachers only. Therefore, in the future it is suggested that the scope of the study be expanded to in-service mathematics teachers and mathematics lecturers at IPG and Public Higher Education Institutions. In addition, it is also suggested in the future that this study be extended to pre-service teachers in the field of early childhood education and rehabilitation. This is because both fields also require mastery of PMUP in implementing their teaching. In addition, from the point of view of model testing, it is suggested in the future to test factors such as socio-economic status and involvement in teaching and research (teaching and research) as variables that affect PMUP. This is because according to (Wen et al., 2019), socioeconomic status factors also influence pre-service teachers' mastery of PK and PPK. Meanwhile, a study by Mu, Liang, Lu and Huang (2018) found that the factor of involvement in teaching and research also affects teachers' knowledge. Therefore, in the future it is suggested that these two factors be included and tested in the model of factors that affect pre-service teachers' PMUP.

### Conclusion

The findings from this study reveal that the main factor influencing PMUP for prospective teachers is PUB. The provision of opportunities to participate in coherent teacher education programs as well as opportunities to attend teaching training by the IPGs had a positive effect on their PMUP. This factor has implications for students' understanding and way of thinking in understanding the material being studied. According to Barnard-Brak et al., (2018) besides being able to increase PMUP, PUB factors can also increase the mathematics learning achievement of prospective teachers. Apart from the PUB factor, the KJHPM factor was also found to influence the PMUP of prospective teachers is valid. Based on the analysis conducted, it is known that the two factors, namely KEPM and PUB, have a contribution of 54% to the PMUP variant. That is, overall this model has moderate predictive power. Thus it is necessary to carry out further research in the future by considering the factors that IPG open more PUB opportunities for prospective teachers to assist them in improving their mastery of PMUP. The research suggests further research to develop these findings and combine them in the world of digital technology in the learning process.

## Acknowledgements

I thank all parties who have helped me provide data and information related to this research..

## Funding

This research was funded by the Indonesian Christian University research institute. "

### References

- Ã, S. M. F., & El-masri, M. M. (2005). Focus on Research Methods Handling Missing Data in Self-Report Measures. 29(9), 488-495. https://doi.org/10.1002/nur
- Adam, R., Ade, P. A. R., Aghanim, N., Ashdown, M., Aumont, J., Baccigalupi, C., Banday, A. J., Barreiro, R. B., Bartolo, N., Battaner, E., Benabed, K., Benoit-Lévy, A., Bersanelli, M., Bielewicz, P., Bikmaev, I., Bonaldi, A., Bond, J. R., Borrill, J., Bouchet, F. R., ... Zonca, A. (Altomotive & Altrophysicsk 596(586),eArl 044e diat https://doi.org/10.1051/0004-6361/201628522
- Alteio, L. V., Séneca, J., Canarini, A., Angel, R., Jansa, J., Guseva, K., Kaiser, C., Richter, A., & Schmidt, H. (2021). A critical perspective on interpreting amplicon sequencing data in soil ecological research. *Soil Biology and*

Biochemistry, 160(July), 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2021.108357

Andersson, C., & Palm, T. (2017). The impact of formative assessment on student achievement: A study of the effects of changes to classroom practice after a comprehensive professional development programme. *Learning and Instruction*, *49*(7), 92–102. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2016.12.006

As, T. I., Of, P., & Effectiveness, *Edutational and* 6Psychological Measurembrit, ng Ef 59(4), 1-17. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1177/00131649921970035

Ayieko, J., Abuogi, L., Simchowitz, B., Bukusi, E. A., Smith, A. H., & Reingold, A. (2014). Efficacy of isoniazid prophylactic therapy in prevention of tuberculosis in children: A meta-analysis. *BMC Infectious Diseases*, *14*(1), 1-10. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2334-14-91

Barnard-Brak, L., Lan, W. Y., & Yang, Z. (2018). Differences in mathematics achievement according to opportunity to learn: A 4pL item response theory examination. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, *56*(November 2017), 1–7. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2017.11.002

Girardet, С., -Meported 018). Berger, J. Vaudroz, C., & Crahay, L., Coherent SAGE Network. 8(1), Classroom Management Practices: А Open, 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244017754119

Blazar, D. (2015). Effective teaching in elementary mathematics: Identifying classroom practices that support student achievement. *Economics of Education Review*, 48(10), 16–29. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econedurev.2015.05.005

Blömeke, S., & Delaney, S. (2012). Assessment of teacher knowledge across countries: A review of the state of research. *ZDM – Mathematics Education*, 44(3), 223–247. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11858-012-0429-7

Blömeke, S., Jenßen, L., Grassmann, M., Dunekacke, S., & Wedekind, H. (2017). Process mediates structure: The relation between preschool teacher education a *Joudinalpof Edwartional Psychology*; hers *109*(3), 338-354. https://doi.org/10.1037/edu0000147

Blömeke, S., Jentsch, A., Ross, N., Kaiser, G., & König, J. (2022). Opening up the black box: Teacher competence, instructional quality, and st*Leardning* t*and Instruction*, *n* 790(Fgbruary)), olg hless. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2022.101600

Chen, I. H., Ahorsu, D. K., Ko, N. Y., Yen, C. F., Lin, C. Y., Griffiths, M. D., & Pakpour, A. H. (2021). Adapting the Motors of Influenza Vaccination Acceptance Scale into the Motors of COVID-19 Vaccination Acceptance Scale: Psychometric evaluation among mainland Chinese university students. *Vaccine*, *39*(32), 4510-4515. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2021.06.044

Dash, G., & Paul, J. (2021). CB-SEM vs PLS-SEM methods for research in social sciences and technology forecasting. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, *173*(June), 121092.1-11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121092

De Costa, P. I., & Norton, B. (2017). Introduction: Identity, Transdisciplinarity, and the Good Language Teacher. *Modern Language Journal*, *101*(1), 3–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/modl.12368

Ekstam, U., Korhonen, J., Linnanmäki, K., & Aunio, P. (2017). Special education pre-s ervice teachers' int knowledge, and teacher efficacy beliefs in mathematics. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 63(4), 338–345. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.01.009

Fauskanger, J. (2016). Matematikklæreres oppfatninger om ingrediensene i god matematikkundervisning. *Acta Didactica Norge*, *10*(3), 1-18. https://doi.org/10.5617/adno.2560

Gesser-Edelsburg, A., & Shahbari, N. A. E. (2017). Decision-making on terminating pregnancy for Muslim Arab women pregnant with fetuses with congenital anomalies: maternal affect and doctor-patient communication. *Reproductive Health*, *14*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12978-017-0312-7

Hainora Hamzah, Mohd Isa Hamzah, & Hafizhah Zulkifli. (2022). Systematic Literature Review on the Elements of Metacognition-Based Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) Teaching and Learning Modules. *Sustainability* (*Switzerland*), *14*(2), 1-15. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.3390/su14020813

Hair, J. F., Hult, G. T. M., Ringle, C. M., Sarstedt, M., & Thiele, K. O. (2017). Mirror, mirror on the wall: a comparative evaluation of composite-based structural equation modeling methods. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, *45*(5), 616–632. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11747-017-0517-x

Hart, L. C., Smith, S. Z., Swars, S. L., & Smith, M. E. (2009). An examination of research methods in mathematics education (1995-2005). *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, *3*(1), 26-41. https://doi.org/10.1177/1558689808325771

Hine, C., Harputlugil, E., Zhang, Y., Ruckenstuhl, C., Lee, B. C., Brace, L., Longchamp, A., Treviño-Villarreal, J. H., Mejia, P., Ozaki, C. K., Wang, R., Gladyshev, V. N., Madeo, F., Mair, W. B., & Mitchell, J. R. (2015). Endogenous hydrogen sulfide production is essential for dietary restriction benefits. *Cell*, *160*(1–2), 132–144. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2014.11.048

Höhn, A., Weber, D., Jung, T., Ott, C., Hugo, M., Kochlik, B., Kehm, R., König, J., Grune, T., & Castro, J. P. (2017). Happily (n)ever after: Aging in the context of oxidative stress, proteostasis loss and cellular senescence. *Redox Biology*, *11*(December 2016), 482–501. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.redox.2016.12.001

Holmbeck, G. N., & Devine, K. A. (2009). Editorial: An author's checklist for me manuscripts. *Journal of Pediatric Psychology*, 34(7), 691–696. https://doi.org/10.1093/jpepsy/jsp046

Hughes, P., Auslander, S. S., Stinson, D. W., & Fortner, C. K. (2019). Elementary t e a c h e r s ' ma t h e ma t i c a l mathematics anxiety: How do they shape instructional practices? *School Science and Mathematics*, *119*(4), 213–222. https://doi.org/10.1111/ssm.12329

Hwang, G. J., Wang, S. Y., & Lai, C. L. (2021). Effects of a social regulation-b a s e d online learning frame learning achievements and behaviors in mathematics. *Computers and Education*, *160*(1), 104031.1-5. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.104031

Ingvarson, L., & Rowley, G. (2017). Quality Assurance in Teacher Education and Outcomes: A Study of 17 Countries. *Educational Researcher*, *46*(4), 177–193. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X17711900

Jenßen, L., Dunekacke, S., Gustafsson, J. E., & Blömeke, S. (2019). Intelligence and knowledge: the relationship between preschool teachers' cognitive disposit*ZeitschniftsFun Enzie huhngeswistsanschaft*, of r. *22*(6), 1313–1332. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11618-019-00911-2

Kleickmann, T., Richter, D., Kunter, M., Elsner, J., Besser, M., Krauss, S., Cheo, M., & Baumert, J. (2015). Content

knowledge and pedagogical content knowledge in Taiwanese and German mathematics teachers. *Teaching and* Teacher Education, 46(2), 115-126. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2014.11.004

- Koszycki, D., Raab, K., Aldosary, F., & Bradwejn, J. (2010). A multifaith spiritually based intervention for generalized anxiety disorder: A pilot randomized trial. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, *66*(4), 430–441. https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp
- Larabi, I. A., Fabresse, N., Etting, I., Nadour, L., Pfau, G., Raphalen, J. H., Philippe, P., Edel, Y., & Alvarez, J. C. (2019). Prevalence of New Psychoactive Substances (NPS) and conventional drugs of abuse (DOA) in high risk populations from Paris (France) and its suburbs: A cross sectional study by hair testing (2012-2017). Drug and Alcohol Dependence, 204(11), 1-34. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.drugalcdep.2019.06.011
- Leong, K. E., Meng, C. C., & Abdul Rahim, S. S. (2015). Understanding Malaysian pre-service teachers mathematical content knowledge and pedagogical content knowledge. Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology *Education, 11*(2), 363–370. https://doi.org/10.12973/eurasia.2015.1346a Lertlumnaphakul, W., Ngoen-Klan, R., Vongkaluang, C., & Chareonviriyaphap, T. (2022). A Review of Termite Species
- and Their Distribution in Thailand. Insects, 13(2), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.3390/insects13020186
- Liu, X., Liu, C., Wei, H., He, S., Dong, S., Zhou, B., Zhang, L., & Li, Y. (2020). A retrospective analysis of 1,717 paranasal sinus fungus ball cases from 2008 to 2017. Laryngoscope, 130(1), 75-79. https://doi.org/10.1002/lary.27869
- Livy, S., & Downton, A. (2018). Exploring experiences for assisting primary pre-service teachers to extend their knowledge of student strategies and reasoning. Journal of Mathematical Behavior, 51(September), 150-160. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmathb.2017.11.004
- Livy, S., Vale, C., & Herbert, S. (2016). Developing primary pre-service teachers' mathematical C C practicum teaching. Australian Iournal of Teacher Education. *41*(2). 152-173. https://doi.org/10.14221/ajte.2016v41n2.10
- Lorscheider, J., Buzzard, K., Jokubaitis, V., Spelman, T., Havrdova, E., Horakova, D., Trojano, M., Izquierdo, G., Girard, Duquette, P., Prat, A., Lugaresi, A., Grand'maison, Pucci, E., ... Kalincinklary pTogres(site Ombultiple sclDrostisi Braim, g39(9),e2895–2405. F., М., С., https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/aww173
- Mathelier, A., Fornes, O., Arenillas, D. J., Chen, C. Y., Denay, G., Lee, J., Shi, W., Shyr, C., Tan, G., Worsley-Hunt, R., Zhang, A. W., Parcy, F., Lenhard, B., Sandelin, A., & Wasserman, W. W. (2016). JASPAR 2016: A major expansion and update of the open-access database of transcription factor binding profiles. Nucleic Acids Research, 44(D1), D110-D115. https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkv1176
- Matney, G., Jackson, J. L., & Panarach, Y. (2016). Establishing Validity of the Thai Mathematics Teaching Efficacy Beliefs Instrument. School Science and Mathematics, 116(3), 164–172. https://doi.org/10.1111/ssm.12165
- Mei, X., Yoshida, W., Lange, M., Lee, J., Zhou, J., Liu, P. H., Leong, K., Zamora, A., Padilla, J., Sarkozy, S., Lai, R., & Deal, W. R. (2015). First Demonstration of Amplification at 1 THz Using 25-nm InP High Electron Mobility Transistor Process. IEEE Electron Device Letters, 36(4), 327-329. https://doi.org/10.1109/LED.2015.2407193
- Mohsenpour, A., Biddle, L., Krug, K., & Bozorgmehr, K. (2021). Measuring deterioration of small-area housing environment: Construction of a multi-dimensional assessment index and validation in shared refugee accommodation. SSM - Population Health, 13(3), 100725. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmph.2020.100725
- Mozahem, N. A., & Adlouni, R. O. (2021). Using Entrepreneurial Self-Efficacy as an Indirect Measure of Entrepreneurial Journal Education. International of Management Education, 19(1),100385.1-10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2020.100385
- Musgrave, S., & Carlson, М. Р. (2017). a n d a d v Understanding knowledge 137-149. for teaching. Journal Mathematical Behavior, of 45, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmathb.2016.12.011
- Napitupulu, S., Haryono, T., Laksmi Riani, A., Sawitri, H. S. R., & Harsono, M. (2017). The impact of career development on employee performance: an empirical study of the public sector in Indonesia. International Review of Public Administration, 22(3), 276-299. https://doi.org/10.1080/12294659.2017.1368003
- Oppermann, E., A. (2016). Anders, Y., & Hachfeld, The influe mathematical ability beliefs on their sensitivity to mathematics i Treachingi and Treachingi and pla Education, 58(8), 174-184. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.05.004
- Oxelgren, U. W., Myrelid, Å., Annerén, G., Ekstam, B., Göransson, C., Holmbom, A., Isaksson, A., Åberg, M., Gustafsson, J., & Fernell, E. (2017). Prevalence of autism and attention-deficit-hyperactivity disorder in Down syndrome: a Developmental Medicine and Child population-based studv. Neurology, *59*(3). 276-283. https://doi.org/10.1111/dmcn.13217
- Pape, L. A., Awais, M., Woznicki, E. M., Suzuki, T., Trimarchi, S., Evangelista, A., Myrmel, T., Larsen, M., Harris, K. M., Greason, K., Di Eusanio, M., Bossone, E., Montgomery, D. G., Eagle, K. A., Nienaber, C. A., Isselbacher, E. M., & P. (2015). Presentomantes iofo arrute admitia dissection:s1,7-yearnticends from the O'Gara, international registry of acute aortic dissection. Journal of the American College of Cardiology, 66(4), 350–358. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jacc.2015.05.029
- Philippou, K., Christou, C. N., Socoliuc, V., Vekas, L., Tanasă, E., Miclau, M., Pashalidis, I., & Krasia-Christoforou, T. (2021). Superparamagnetic polyvinylpyrrolidone/chitosan/Fe3O4 electrospun nanofibers as effective U(VI) adsorbents. Journal of Applied Polymer Science, 138(15), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.1002/app.50212
- n, H., & Youngs, P. (2016). The effect of teacher educ knowledge: a five-country analysis using TEDS-M data. *Journal of Mathematics Teacher Education*, 19(4), 371– Qian, education 396. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10857-014-9297-0
- Ren, B., Yan, F., Kuang, Y., Li, N., Zhang, D., Zhou, X., Lin, H., & Zhou, H. (2018). Improved Base Editor for Efficiently Inducing Genetic Variations in Rice with CRISPR/Cas9-Guided Hyperactive hAID Mutant. Molecular Plant, 11(4), 623-626. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molp.2018.01.005
- Richardson, D. B. (2013). Electric vehicles and the electric grid: A review of modeling approaches, Impacts, and renewable energy integration. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, *19*(3), 247 - 254. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2012.11.042
- Sanchez-Franco, M. J., & Roldán, J. L. (2010). Expressive aesthetics to ease perceived community support: Exploring

personal innovativeness and routinised behaviour as moderators in Tuenti. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *26*(6), 1445–1457. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2010.04.023

- Senk, S. L., Tatto, M. T., Reckase, M., Rowley, G., Peck, R., & Bankov, K. (2012). Knowledge of future primary teachers for teaching mathematics: An international comparative study. *ZDM – Mathematics Education*, 44(3), 307–324. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11858-012-0400-7
- Shabana, K. M., Buchholtz, A. K., & Carroll, A. B. (2017). The Institutionalization of Corporate Social Responsibility Reporting. *Business and Society*, *56*(8), 1107–1135. https://doi.org/10.1177/0007650316628177
- Sutton, J., & Austin, Z. (2015). Qualitative reserch: data collection, analysis, and managment. *The Canadian Journal of Hospital Pharmacy*, *68*(3), 226–231.
- Swars, S., Hart, L. C., Smith, S. Z., Smith, M. E., & Tolar, T. (2007). A Longitudinal Study of Elementary Pre-service Teachers' Mathematics Belief *SchoolnSchience cand* Mathematics, o107(89, d8g5e335. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1949-8594.2007.tb17797.x
- Tajudin, N. M., Chinnappan, M., & Saad, N. S. (2017). Relationship between mathematics teacher subject matter knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge and professional development needs. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 1847(1), 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4983878
- Tatto, M. T. (2015). The role of research in the policy and practice of quality teacher education: an international review. *Oxford Review of Education*, *41*(2), 171–201. https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2015.1017405
- Tatto, M. T., Rodriguez, M., & Lu, Y. (2015). The influence of teacher education on mathematics teaching knowledge: Local implementation of global ideals. In *International Perspectives on Education and Society* (Vol. 27). https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-367920140000027004
- Thanheiser, E., Browning, C. A., Lo, J. J., Kastberg, S., & Edson, A. J. (2013). Building a knowledge base: Understanding prospective elementary school teached *international Journal fori Mathematics* nten *Teaching and Learning*, 4(July), 1–32. http://www.cimt.plymouth.ac.uk/journal/thanheiser.pdf
- Travis, W. D., Brambilla, E., Nicholson, A. G., Yatabe, Y., Austin, J. H. M., Beasley, M. B., Chirieac, L. R., Dacic, S., Duhig, E., Flieder, D. B., Geisinger, K., Hirsch, F. R., Ishikawa, Y., Kerr, K. M., Noguchi, M., Pelosi, G., Powell, C. A., Tsao, M. S., & Wistuba, I. (2015). The 2015 World Health Organization Classification of Lung Tumors: Impact of Genetic, Clinical and Radiologic Advances since the 2004 Classification. *Journal of Thoracic Oncology*, *10*(9), 1243–1260. https://doi.org/10.1097/JTO.00000000000630
- Venkat, H., & Spaull, N. (2015). What do we know about primary Africa? An analysis of SACMEQ 2007. International Journal of Educational Development, 41(3), 121-130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2015.02.002
- Volk, M., Cotič, M., Zajc, M., & Istenic Starcic, A. (2017). Tablet-based cross-curricular maths vs. traditional maths classroom practice for higher-order learning outcomes. *Computers and Education*, *114*(11), 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2017.06.004
- Wen, S., Dooner, M., Papa, E., Del Tatto, M., Pereira, M., Borgovan, T., Cheng, Y., Goldberg, L., Liang, O., Camussi, G., & Quesenberry, P. (2019). Biodistribution of mesenchymal stem cell-derived extracellular vesicles in a radiation injury bone marrow murine model. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, *20*(21), 1-15. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms20215468
- Wildeman, E., Koopman, M., & Beijaard, D. (2022). Fostering subject teachers' integra vocational education: Results of a professional development program. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 112(4), 103626.1-14. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2021.103626
- Yeşildere, S., & Akkoç, H. (2010). Algebraic generalization strategies of number patterns used by pre-service elementary mathematics teachers. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *2*(2), 1142–1147. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.162
- Zulkpli, Z., Mohamed, M., & Abdullah, A. H. (2017). Assessing Mathematics Skills. Sains Humanika, 9(1-4), 83-87. https://doi.org/10.11113/sh.v9n1-4.1129